

Police Station FAQ:

There has been good deal of vigorous discussion regarding the proposed Provincetown Police Station. Given that there is a lot of information to digest, this memo addresses the most common concerns and provides information so as to provide clarification, and if needed, correct any misconceptions.

In 2009, a needs assessment was performed for the Provincetown Police Station to determine functionality of the facility. This sparked the 6 year process of vetting the most suitable solution for the Provincetown Police Department. The lengthy process included discussion of a shared site between the DPW and Police, renovation of the existing building, and relocation of the station entirely. After review and approval by the Select Board, on January 11, 2012, Kaestle Boos Associates, Inc., was hired to design a Highway Department and Police Station facility.

A Building Committee was formed in June of 2012 to focus solely on determining the best solution for the Town. Between 2012 and 2015 the Building Committee visited different police stations throughout the Cape, examined numerous sites within Provincetown where a station may be sited, and worked with Kaestle Boos to develop a preliminary design. Through this process, the Highway Department portion of this design was eliminated (as a result of preliminary costs estimates), and focus shifted to just the design of a Police Station.

In conjunction with this, a subsequent report on the existing conditions of the current police station was done in 2015 by The Carell Group. The focus of this study determined that the cost to repair the existing station, based on the current building code requirements, would not be cost effective. In October 2015, town meeting authorized \$39,000 to develop a final building program. Part of this work was to identify and analyze site options and related costs.

Over the course of 6-8 months, the Building Committee and staff looked at different locations, all of which were presented to the public at the November 2016 Town Forum. In each comparison, approximately 12,000 square feet of finished space and approximately 1,800 square feet of unfinished storage space were identified. The 1,800 square feet, in other words, was the basement, and would be used for archive storage. Given the existing site constraints at the current police station location, the lack of space to expand, and the inability to renovate the building in a financially responsible manor, the 16 Jerome Smith Location was the preferred site. This site had the ability to have a building with 12,226SF of department space and 1,324SF of archival storage space.

Tax Impact based on the FY 2019 Evaluations:

<u>Property Type</u>	<u>Value</u>	<u>Authorized tax impact</u> <u>\$8.6M Police Station</u>	<u>Proposed tax impact</u> <u>\$12.4M Police Station</u>	<u>Cost</u> <u>Difference</u>
Median Single Family Home	\$869,300.00	\$222.71	\$320.82	\$98.11
Median Condominium	\$448,400.00	\$114.88	\$165.48	\$50.60

Why is this work happening 2 years later?

At the April 2017 Annual Town Meeting, voters approved moving forward to design and build a police station of 12,226SF along with 1,324SF of unfinished storage space at 16 Jerome Smith Road in the basement, and a budget of \$8.6 million dollars. This price was estimated based on the Fall 2016 Kaestle Boos Associates study (conceptual design).

In accordance with state law, projects over \$1.5 million dollars require the selection of an Owner's Project Manager (OPM) before proceeding to the selection of an architect. In September of 2017, a

Request for Proposals (RFP) was issued for an OPM. After review by the Building Committee and approval of the Select Board on January 22nd, 2018, a contract was executed with Environmental Partners Group (EPG).

The next month, in February 2018, an RFP was issued for designer services to design the police station. After review and approval by the Select Board on May 14, 2018, a contract was executed with Flansburgh Architects.

Since last May, Flansburgh commenced work on the Schematic Design (SD) phase, including a detailed site survey, subsurface site investigation, and soil borings. While conducting the site survey, they determined that groundwater elevations were shallow at the site: the water table is five feet below existing grade, and could worsen with climate change. As a basement would be expensive to construct and maintain, the decision was made that it would be impractical to build. A two-story building design was developed based on the building program requirements established by KB during the prior study phase, and confirmed by Flansburgh through discussions with the Police Department and Building Committee.

From May through November, the Building Committee held a series of public meetings where they monitored Flansburgh's progress, received updates, and began the cost and design reviews.

On November 13th, 2018, the Building Committee and Flansburgh design team presented to the Select Board the final schematic design. The Select Board voted to move forward with the project.

The next step is moving from the SD phase to design development (DD) phase, and then preparation of detailed construction drawings suitable for public bidding in February 2019. Construction documents would then be put out for bid. The goal of the Building Committee is to have actual bid results to go to Town Meeting in April 2019. If successful in receiving approval from the voters for the budget increase, a general contractor will be secured to construct the police station, and construction will commence.

Price increase explanation

Proposed budget changes do not add up to the additional \$4 million dollar request-10% of cost & 9% of cost do not add to \$4 million dollars.

For the presentation at the Select Board Meeting of November 13, 2018, only a general overview of the budget was provided. Please note: the revised estimate presented at that meeting is supported by two independent cost studies. The current estimate includes both hard and soft costs. Hard costs are those associated with the actual construction. Soft costs include the architectural and engineering design services along with the furniture, technology systems, and other police equipment that is needed for the building.

The cost increases we are seeing are driven by the hard costs of construction. The estimated hard costs associated with the Flansburgh Police Station Design are detailed in the attached cost analysis that was completed by Ellana Construction, and then verified by our OPM. The analysis breaks down the percentages and details the increase in costs. Overall, hard costs have increased by approximately \$2.88M and soft costs have increased by \$1.11M, for a total increase from the authorized amount of \$3.99M.

The details are as follows: hard construction costs are currently estimated through to the mid-point of construction at \$9.8M compared to the estimate from the fall of 2016 of \$6.99M. The increase in hard costs is \$2.88M. The main line item differences are shown in the attached table (Attachment #1) and highlighted in yellow. The KB estimate may have been based on depressed pricing in 2016 and furthermore did not appear to include a premium for working in a remote location. Current estimates include a 10% premium for working in Provincetown.

As mentioned above the \$9.8 million is the hard cost portion of the budget. In addition, there are the soft costs necessary for the project (Attachment #1). These soft costs include the necessary engineering and architectural costs, along with the cost of the OPM, and then police equipment such as the furniture, IT and Security systems. In this area, cost estimates have been updated. Attachment shows the breakdown of all of the soft costs, and how the total estimated price of the entire project comes to \$12.42 million dollars. In a significant example, the IT and Security budget was estimated by KB in 2016 to be \$240,000, whereas the current estimate by Flansburgh Design is \$604,000 (Attachment #1).

The price per square foot does not translate to \$708-how was that number derived.

Provincetown's \$708/square foot cost is as follows: The current hard cost estimate presented to the Select Board on November 13, 2018 to construct the Police Station was \$9,803,350, and when divided by 13,864 Square Feet (The Fall 2018 Flansburgh Design) is \$707.10/square foot (rounded to \$708). To check this unit cost, the team looked at other projects on Cape Cod.

The Wellfleet police station costs per sq. ft. from September 2016 was determined from the construction contract amount and escalated to 2018. The square footage calculations for the Town of Provincetown are derived from the cost to build the station, and do not include the soft costs (Refer to Attachment #1).

Example: Orleans bids were opened in April 2016. Using \$11,457,850 for a 18,000 SF building (the hard cost for construction of the Orleans Police Station), the unit cost is approximately \$637 per square foot. When you inflate the Orleans bid amount to September 2018, it becomes \$695 ($\637×1.09) per sq. ft. At the time of publishing the Town had assumed a growth inflation rate of 9%.

However, since that initial inflation rate assumption the Turner Index published a standard cost index, the difference between the 3rd quarter 2016 and the 3rd quarter 2018 (1105) of 11.06%. Using that same 11.06% inflation factor on this project, adding 5% for inflation from now to the mid-point of construction, this leads to an updated cost of \$739/sf ($\$637 \times 1.16\%$). The Town estimates that the per square foot construction cost will be between \$700 and \$730. Given the professional cost estimators current estimate of construction hard cost for the Provincetown Police Station to be approximately \$9.0 Million Dollars. The Town is carrying an estimated inflation rate of 9% to the mid-point of construction which amounts to \$9.8 million dollars or \$708/sf.

The \$9.8M hard construction cost was developed based on the Schematic Design Drawings prepared by Flansburgh, and two (2) independent professional estimates (Flansburgh/Ellana and EPG/Costpro). These estimates were within \$100k of each other, or approximately 1% of \$9.8M, confirming that \$9.8M is an accurate estimate for hard construction costs, including a contingency of over \$700k (See Attachment #1).

As a comparative back check, the team then looked at other projects on Cape Cod. The most appropriate comparative cost metric to use is the unit construction cost per square foot (\$/SF). While other projects vary in size, building types, and materials, the unit cost metric provides a useful comparison to gauge the range of costs.

Cost of building in Provincetown inflated/ station can be built for \$8 million.

As mentioned above, earlier this fall the Building Committee directed the OPM and Architect to examine the cost alternatives again, particularly to determine what could be built with the \$6.3 million 2016 authorization for construction. For that amount of money, only a 9,000SF (700SF larger than the current Police Station) could be built, which neither satisfies the current standards, nor does it meet the building program requirements developed during the study phase by KB, and confirmed during the schematic design phase by Flansburgh.

Option	Total Construction Cost	Gross SF	Cost / SF
1-Build to Budget:	\$7,017,605	9,014	\$779
2-Pre-Engineered Building Option:	\$9,554,194	13,897	\$688
3-Reduced Foundation Option:	\$9,639,555	13,864	\$696
4-Preferred Option	\$9,803,350	13,864	\$708

All of these proposed structures were sited at the Jerome Smith location. Option #1, the Build to Budget option, would not meet the Police Department's needs. This proposal results in a single story 9,000 SF building. Option #2, the pre-engineered building, did not reflect the town's character need for a civic presence on Route 6. This option was for a two-story building. Option #3, the reduced foundation buildings layout, provided two less foundation corners by aligning exterior walls. This change resulted in a floor plan layout that would not function properly for police operations day to day activities.

Option #4, the chosen option, a 13,864 sf. two story building on Jerome Smith site, meets all the program and operational needs of the police department, and reflected the town's character, while creating a civic presence on Route 6. A model of the station will be on display at the Provincetown Town Hall starting mid-January.

Is there a path for trimming costs? Will building materials chosen make a difference?

Upon receiving the initial revised cost estimate, the Building Committee reviewed several cost saving initiatives that cut \$500,000 from the project, to reduce the hard cost construction costs to \$9.8 million, and arrive at the current total project cost estimate of \$12.4 million. As to building materials, while the architect is pricing out several exterior materials, any change of exterior materials will change the aesthetics, but will not have a significant impact on the overall price.

While this estimate has been put together with research and scrutiny, the final cost of the police station will be determined only after receipt of the bids.

What happened to Kaestle Boos Associates/why were they not chosen.

They did not respond as the lead architect to the Request for Proposals issued by the Town of Provincetown for the design of the new police station. Kaestle Boos was listed as a sub-consultant to

the firm T2 Architecture that submitted a proposal, and the T2 team was interviewed as part of the selection process.

The Police Station has increased in size - Why did the size increase?

The design presented to the Select Board on November 13th, 2018, is 314 SF larger than the 2016 Kaestle Boos conceptual plans. The revised design and decision to create a two story structure lead to efficiencies in the overall design (See Attachment #2). As mentioned earlier, soil borings and a review of the water table determined that it would be impractical to build and maintain a basement, and very expensive to construct. The second change-the conversion of unfinished space to finished space (see Attachment #3). In the Kaestle Boos design, the basement square footage, which varied between 1,200 and 1,800 square feet, was unfinished space set aside for storage. While the overall square footage has only changed by 314SF, the current design includes finishing out 1819SF of what had been the basement space. The square footage of the storage space is driven by the current space needs to accommodate existing archive storage at the old station, and provides for future archive storage. The 2 story design accommodated this element with minimal impact to the overall building square footage.

The breakdown is as follows:

Conceptual Estimate (Kaestle Boos) Fall 2016

Consists of 12,226SF of finished + 1,324SF of unfinished basement space = 13,550SF

Schematic Estimate (Flansburgh Architects) Fall 2018

Consists of 12,045SF of finished + 1,819SF of finished archive space=13,864SF (Attachment #2)

The original site should have been used

As mentioned above, as part of the effort that led up to the approval of April 2017, the Building Committee and staff looked at each of the different locations and related costs, all of which were presented to the public. The final result of the site selection analysis was presented at the April 2017 Town Meeting. It was determined that even if built to the maximum, the building program would not fit on the current site and as well reconstruction in place would require temporary quarters during construction and two (2) moves by the police department, escalating the comparable project costs. The new building site affords the Town an opportunity to evaluate reuse of the existing police station.

Building design came out of left field/where did the building design come from

The Kaestle Boos efforts that lead to the April annual Town meeting authorization, was focused on the building program and site selection. It was not a design effort. The design architects, Flansburgh Architects, were selected to provide the building design based on the building design program lay out. They developed the building program and layout during the schematic design phase, with feedback from the building committee.

Not handicapped accessible without the elevators/frequent loss of power within this area

The proposed police station will comply with all the handicapped codes and as it is a two story building and will have an elevator. The design for the site includes a back-up generator.

Attachments:

1. EPG Cost Comparison Summary Table with Highlighted Differences, dated Dec. 12, 2018.
2. Excerpt from Flansburgh Slide Presentation to the Select Board on November 13, 2018

Provincetown Police Station
Updated Cost Comparison Sheet

December 12 2018 Summary

Attachment #1

Description	Estimates			Difference
	Kaestle - 2016	Flansburgh/Ellana - 2018		
Building - Material and Labor	\$4,611,000	\$5,498,388		
Sitework - Material and Labor	\$255,000	\$822,300		
Trade Cost Sub-Total	\$4,865,833	\$6,320,688		\$1,454,855
Design Contingency	10.00% \$487,000	n/a		
Trade Cost Total	\$5,353,000	\$6,320,688		
Option 1: Fitout for Additional Basement Area	\$124,000	n/a		
GC's General Conditions and Fee	7.50% \$401,000	15.00% \$948,103		
Overhead and Profit	3.00% \$174,000	Incid above \$0		
Hard Costs Contingency	n/a	\$726,879		
Building Permit		\$39,978		
Insurance and Bonds	1.65% \$96,000	1.75% \$140,624		
Location Premium		\$817,627		\$817,627
Escalation to Bid Date	3.30% \$199,000	n/a		
Escalation to Mid Point of Construction	n/a \$0	\$809,451		\$610,451
Total Construction Costs	\$6,996,000	\$9,803,350		\$2,882,933
Owner's Costs (Soft Costs)				
Geotech	\$20,000	\$20,000		
Survey	\$15,000	\$15,000		
Arch. And Eng. Fees	\$620,000	\$600,000		
A/E Fee Adjustment - Allowance	\$30,000	\$95,000		
Add. Service/Reimbursable	\$280,000	\$31,000		
Owner Project Management (OPM)		\$277,780		
OPM Fee Adjustment - Allowance	\$3,000	\$170,000		
Structural Peer Review	\$25,000	\$3,000		
Utility Back charge Allowance	\$100,000	\$25,000		
Security System and Equipment Allowance	\$120,000	\$100,000		
PPD Furnishings and Furniture Allowance	\$240,000	\$390,000		
Communications Equipment Allowance	\$7,000	\$604,000		
Printing/Miscellaneous	\$10,000	\$7,000		
Legal/Advertising	\$35,000	\$10,000		
Material Testing	\$0	\$35,000		
Soft Costs Contingency		10.00% \$238,278		
Total Owner's Costs	\$1,505,000	\$2,621,058		\$1,116,058
Total Project Cost	\$8,625,000	\$12,424,408		\$3,998,991

FT v PT Construction Services

FA updated costs Sept 6 2018

Updated Tech costs

Net Escalation Difference

Note: Value Engineering cost savings of \$547k included in base construction cost.

Space Summary Comparison: 2016 Conceptual Design & 2018 Preferred Option

Attachment #2

PROGRAM TYPE	2016 SF	2018 SF
PUBLIC ENTRY & PUBLIC SERVICE AREAS	673	675
BUREAU OF RECORDS	452	450
DISPATCH & PATROL COMMAND	435	539
ADMINISTRATION/SENIOR COMMAND	1,396	1,482
DETECTIVES UNIT	633	508
POLICE OPERATIONS	1,344	1,476
DETENTION	1,516	1,522
PERSONNEL SUPPORT	673	865
OPERATIONS SUPPORT	1,026	859
Net Square Footage	8,148	8,376
Gross Square Footage	12,226	12,045
Archive Storage	1,324	1,819
TOTAL BUILDING SQUARE FOOTAGE	13,550	13,864

Provincetown Police Station
Provincetown, Massachusetts

FLANSBURGH
11.13.2018