



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

March 3, 2010

Grace Gouveia Building- Room 10

3:30 p.m.

Members Present: Polly Burnell (arr 3:45p-left 6:15p), Nathan Butera, John Dowd, Marcene Marcoux, Carol Neal, and David McGlothlin.

Members Absent: NONE

Staff: Maxine Notaro

The meeting was called to order at 3:30 p.m.

Work Session 3:30 p.m.

Administrative Reviews

Discussion regarding 9 Soper Street violations

John Fahamian was called before the HDC to defend building his deck without a permit. He claimed that he had been in Florida and his workmen started it without his knowledge. He has photos on how it looked before and he said he owned the building since 1991. The whole septic system was replaced and was located under the deck. David McGlothlin said that the issue is - you never came before us – but just built. Maxine said that the local contractor's mantra is: "It's easier to ask for forgiveness after a job is done." and we don't want to continue that. John F. said that he just wants direction. John Dowd said that he thinks the posts are appropriate for the house and it's a design flaw but he doesn't know how to address this since it conforms historically. Maxine wants it written in the plan that the posts must be evenly spaced and all posts are to be capped. Carol wrote out what was needed.

Discussion regarding 24 Franklin Street violations

Rob Tosner, the owner, asked the HDC which issues they wanted to start with. Marcene Marcoux went back to the original decisions: windows have to be 2 over 1 throughout. Rob said he made a mistake with the dividers that go on the inside of the windows and he has contacted Anderson windows and they will be able to put on an outside mullion and they guarantee that it won't fall off.

Marcene continued by saying that the doors on Bradford Street aren't what were approved. Rob said they are temporary but just decorative doors that won't be used; he is getting them from a restoration place in Maine (that the HDC suggested).

Rob then said that there are people in the community that put nasty stuff on the blog and don't even have the courage to sign their names. He has found the attacks very hurtful and would prefer to have these attacks frontal (as in tell him personally what they think) rather than having them hide behind anonymous, damaging comments.

A discussion was held on the fake chimney mandated by HDC and John Dowd said all alterations from accepted plans should be notified to the HDC.

Rob said that he will be recreating the entire chimney especially since they had to take off the entire roof. John wants a very thin grout – not battleship grey and wide..... maybe a little darker. Marcene – even after all the explanations – was still lecturing.

Then there were apologies all around..... Rob will communicate all further happenings through Maxine. David wants to see all the catalog pictures (doors & windows) and in that way we won't have any future confusion.

Deborah Paine, Inc. on behalf of Katzel Nominee Trust, **447 Commercial Street**, remove south facing awning window and replace with casement bow window
This was a no show.

Deborah Paine, Inc. on behalf of Chandler House Condominiums, **481 Commercial Street**, replace exterior spiral stairs in kind
This, too, was a no show.

Mark Kinnane of Cape Associates, Inc. on behalf of Greg Manuel, **199 Commercial Street**, replace one 8' wide double hung and picture window unit with one 6' double hung and picture window unit and add a new window
Mark presented the plan and said that basically he's replacing (read the above request) John suggested doing 2 over 1 for the side windows. It's a condo building and we have to look at where these windows are but it's the same owners who want the changes. John said that he doesn't like the shape of the window saying that it's inappropriate for the style of the building. Polly and Marcene want a full review to be consistent and David agreed.

A discussion was held among the members of the HDC on what should be heard under Administrative Review and what should mandate a Public Hearing without final conclusions. Mark will return with adjusted plans.

Motion: Move to make the windows 24 X 30.

Motion: John Dowd Seconded: Polly Burnell Vote: 5-0-0.

300 Commercial Street – Mayflower Cafe – door replacement - this was approved.

221 Bradford Street – replace stairs – this was approved.

David Nicolau, a real estate broker, had a question about demolition delay for two different properties. **Clem and Ursies** is one of the properties which was originally a Dairy Queen. The building has always been a summer building so do you want a full review? Can we say that it doesn't have any historic significance? It was built in 1955. Once again there were disagreements among the members: John said that everything has been eradicated and all we can do is to have a 6 months delay and then they'll tear it down anyway. A public hearing is mandated and the question loomed – “Why do we have a demolition by-law, what does it say, and how do we enforce it?” David M. said, “So what are you trying to preserve?”

David N. said the reason for a demolition delay is so you can go and see if its important – so when you look at Clem & Ursies – what are you going to preserve? so that's the question I pose to you and is there a way to expedite this? Marcene said that the public has to weigh in on this. Polly said that it has to be noticed out.

David N. had another one – he also wants to smash **Michael Shays** by demolishing it. It had been a Howard Johnsons so a demolition delay may be mandated. To be continued.....

Review and approve previous minutes

This was done later in the meeting.

Discussion on Policy and Procedures

This wasn't held but a work session is planned for later in the month.

Pending Case

FY10-20 (Case continued to March 17, 2010)

Application by Robert Valois on behalf of Fine Arts Realty Trust, Warren Cresswell for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The

applicant seeks approval for the following renovations: West Elevation: construct dormer, add new egress decks and stairs; South Elevation: Reconstruct decks and add an egress spiral stairway, construct third floor balcony and replace widow with a door and to reconfigure/replace doors and windows and add new doors and windows on West, South and East Elevations at the property located at **417 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.** Robert didn't return so he must be still working on the design.

Public Hearing 4:35 p.m.

FY10-21

Application by Richard Salvador on behalf of Hirschel Mcginnis for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 11, Demolition Delay Bylaws 11-1-5. The applicant seeks approval to demolish two existing cottages/sheds and replace with one cottage at the property located at **61 Pleasant Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Richard Salvador presented the case and it was decided that the older cottage will be cannibalized.

Motion: Move to approve as presented.

Motion: Polly Burnell Seconded: John Dowd Vote: 5-0-0

FY10-22

Application by John Reis, Inc. on behalf of Laurie Liss and Kathleen Moira Ryan for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to construct a second floor addition to an existing cottage at the property located at **12 Cottage Street, Unit #3, Provincetown, MA.**

John Reis presented his plan along with explanations on how he had to cut the building back because of the set back requirement. The new elevations were brought in just today. John did the window measurements and he wrote them by each window.

Polly thinks it's out of scale. John D. had a suggestion for a smaller cottage. He'd allow a dormer on both sides. There was talk about how to redesign the cottage so that it doesn't look like a silo.

Motion: Move to continue and waive any and all time constraints until March 17th.

Motion: Carol Neal Seconded: David McGlothlin Vote: 5-0-0.

FY10-23

Application by Paul Van Apeldoorn for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval enlarge the front porch, remove a window and install entry door, attach the existing cottage to the main house with a flat roof addition with a roof deck and to install circular stairs to replace the existing second floor second means of egress at the property located at **508 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

The plan involves making the cottage easier to rent because it's too small.

Tim said that he had recently had an installation approved in Orleans but it hadn't been installed as yet. Marcene thought that maybe 5 Pleasant Street could be approved and then used as a prototype that the HDC could monitor. The problem cited was that once one person gets one then others would say – “Why can't I have one, too, when you gave permission to 5 Pleasant Street?” John said he approved of turbines but would not like to see them attached to a house and would only approve a pole installation as the least egregious.

Polly said that she's a member of the Historic Commission, too, and will ask Eric Dray what his thoughts are.

Tim said that the cost of this machine is about a 10 year pay back but adding a pole, base, necessary underground wire, etc. would move the payback time to 20 odd years. John said just because it's more economically feasible doesn't make it better.

The Building Commissioner feels that turbines are like any antenna.

Everybody then began repeating their opinions with the following motion made:

Motion: Move to accept the wind turbine on a flag pole away from the house.

Motion: John Dowd Seconded: Carol Neal Vote: 5-0-0.

The applicant wants to have the motion rescinded.

Motion: Move to rescind the previous motion at the request of the applicant.

Motion: Move to request a continuation waiving any and all time constraints until the April 7th meeting.

Motion: Marcene Marcoux Seconded: David McGlothlin Vote: 5-0-0

230 Bradford Street – French door replacement

The applicant had been told at a previous meeting that what he planned to do was agreeable. David said that because there was a change in the opening they thought he should come back with more details. John objected saying that the scale of the double doors is too large as a secondary side entry making it hierarchically more important than the front entry.

Minutes:

Motion: Move to accept the minutes of January 20th as written.

Motion: Carol Neal Seconded: David McGlothlin-

Vote: 3-0-2 ab (JD & MM)

Motion: Move to accept the minutes of February 3rd as amended by MM.

Motion: Marcene Marcoux Seconded: Nathan Butera

Vote: 3-0-3 ab (PB, JD, CN)

Motion: Move to accept the minutes of February 17th as amended.

Motion: Carol Neal Seconded: Nathan Butera Vote: 2-0-1 ab (PB)

Follow the bouncing ball..... back to:

447 Commercial St - Deb Paine -

Motion: Move to deny this application. No to all bow windows and the balusters have not been captured.

Motion: Made, seconded, and approved by all remaining HDC members.

481 Commercial Street.... replace in kind. spiral staircase.....

This application was approved.

5 Bradford Street – no application so it was not considered.

417 Commercial Street Robert Valois’ plan was a picture of what is proposed. He will be returning with a different plan.

Maxine got a letter from Scott and Gregg (new coffee shop and real estate office) stating that your suggestions were valuable. Many thanks.

Maxine e-mailed about the upcoming historic seminar on March 25th – Carol’s birthday is the 26th so she’s iffy about attending.

Adjournment happened at 7:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Evelyn Gaudiano

E. Rogers Gaudiano

Approved by _____ on _____, 2010.