

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

March 21, 2007

Judge Welsh Hearing Room

3:30 p.m.

Members Present: Steven Bergquist, Polly Burnell (arr 4:00p), John Dowd (arr 3:40p), Marcene Marcoux, and Carol Neal.

Members Absent: Nathan Butera and Clo Tepper

Staff: Matt Mulvey (arr 3:55) and Maxine Notaro

The meeting was called to order at 3:35 p.m.

Work Sessions

437-439 Commercial Street

Deb Paine said that she had received an e-mail about the Chapter 91 license of this property. The state wants a public right of way down to the beach. "Poor Richards" has already donated land from the beach for an outdoor art gallery. An attorney called the DEP in October and they said they had changed their minds and the DEP cited all kinds of conditions that are ridiculous. To put a public right of way down the middle of the property is absurd. She's asking the HDC to write a letter to the DEP saying that public access down the middle of the property is ridiculous. There is a 5 ft right of way one door up from this property. Deb is quite emotional about this property; it has elderly owners who are distressed by the latest rulings of the DEP.

Carol Neal asked to whom the letter should be addressed. Marcene Marcoux would like more information. Deb said that she would be happy to meet Marcene down there and walk her through - point by point. The artist's area is in front of unit 10.

4 Conant Street

Yuriy Litvinov, the contractor, said he'd like to remove a non-operating chimney from a two-story cottage on the property. He also said that the windows are rotting and need to be replaced. John Dowd said that for the historical integrity of the town, you have to leave the chimney from the roof up. Yuri understood and said, "So I'll just make a fake one, O.K.?"

Motion: Approval with the following conditions:

- 1. Replacement windows must be 2 over 1 with factory applied muntins.**
- 2. Pretend chimney above the roofline must have narrow joints.**

Motion: John Dowd Seconded: Carol Neal Vote: 4-0-0.

191A Commercial Street

Sean Cowing said he wants to remove and replace existing deck; also enlarge the deck by two feet.

Motion: Accept as proposed.

Motion: John Dowd Seconded: Carol Neal Vote: 4-0-0.

102A Bradford Street

Elizabeth Gabriel Brooks returned to the HDC, once again. She needs a balcony because smoking

isn't allowed in the rooms. She asked, "Can we keep the gable and behind there put in a teeny tiny deck?" "If that is not approved, perhaps a tiny window?"

After a great deal of verbal sparring, the following decision was made. This large a change would have to be noticed out. The following motion resulted:

Motion: Approve the French door along with the deck but posts must be put in to support it instead of having it cantilevered. Also the detail is to match the one that is in the rear.

Motion: John Dowd Seconded: Marcene Marcoux Vote: 4-0-1 ab (PB)

531 Commercial Street

This property was not on the agenda but was presented under Administrative Review anyway. Glen Parker said he had several detailed clarifications and one revision. Glen's assistant had a myriad of plans that were handed out.

Motion: The plans as submitted are approved.

Motion: John Dowd Seconded: Marcene Marcoux Vote: 5-0-0.

Public Hearing 4:00 p.m.

2007-17 (Continued from March 07, 2007)

Application by Neal Kimball on behalf of Michael Leger for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to remove and reconstruct a roof over a portion of the structure closest to Bradford Street, increase roof pitch and add a short knee wall; add a shed dormer along the west side of the main roof, change the roof over the front bump-out to a hip style from a semi-flat shed style. All original roof trim details will be reconstructed to match the original. Wrap posts supporting the front bump-out and add trim detailing at the property located at **23 Bradford Street, Unit #2, Provincetown, MA.**

Motion: Accept the request to withdraw the application without prejudice.

Motion: John Dowd Seconded: Carol Neal Vote: 5-0-0.

2007-18 (Continued from March 07, 2007)

Application by Neal Kimball on behalf of One Tremont Street Realty Trust, David Martin, Trustee for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to modify previously approved plans for proposed renovations by increasing the roof pitch slightly, and to add a balcony off of the east side of the second floor and other minor adjustments to window and door locations and size and to add two skylights at the property located at **1 Tremont Street, Provincetown, MA.**

John Dowd stepped down since he is an abutter. The new plan presented by the new owners, Thomas W. Fielding and M. Scott O'Connor, called for living quarters above the liquor store that is housed on the first floor.

(The former owner, David Martin, had an approved plan that had the second floor being used as a storage area for the store.)

Neal Kimball said that the plan was originally going to be a 2-story structure but after one meeting he reduced it to a 1-1/2 story structure. The new owners wish to live on the 2nd floor. Neal further said that we raised the roof about 12 inches from what you originally approved. A 24.8 ft overall height

was originally proposed... and now 25.10 is being asked for. Neal Kimball feels it's a subtle increase.

Public Input....

Roxanne Pires, an abutter, said she was very much against this project. It's a liquor store and she didn't feel it was living space. The first plan called for storage on the 2nd floor. Where will trucks unload, etc.

Neil Toelle said that other than the massiveness of it, he thinks it's an improvement. He has mixed feelings about the proposed balcony. A friend of Neil Toelle's said he also feels it's an improvement.

Bob Hendricksen suggested that the HDC take a look at power lines that run down close to the building. The building that was there originally didn't have a basement and now they raised it higher than it was before. He, like Roxanne, is very opposed to the plan.

Public comments were closed.

Carol Neal was not in favor of the increase in the building. Polly Burnell agreed; it's too massive for the corner. Marcene Marcoux said she's really against the increase in height. She would stick with the plan they had before. "We're dealing with a small building that has already grown." Steven Bergquist said he doesn't feel the covered porch is appropriate and would stand by the existing height on the former case. He cited 9B by-law and it's on a very busy corner.

Neal Kimball then began arguing with the HDC and he wants to do a comparison with what's there. All the other buildings that are around the liquor store are at least two stories. He feels this is the most subtle of options.

Steve Bergquist, the newest member of the HDC said, "This drawing is not scaleable - what are the measurements of that porch? There are no dimensions."

After the comments by the HDC, the following motion was made:

Motion: Continue the case

Motion: Polly Burnell Seconded: Steven Bergquist Vote: 4-0-0.

2007-20

Application by Red Clay Properties, LLC on behalf of James Watkins and Dave Krohn for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown and under 11-1-5, Demolition Delay Bylaw. The applicant seeks approval for the demolition of Building "A" and Building "B" at the property located at **21 Bradford Street Extension Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Carol Neal stepped down.

David Krohn, one of the owners, asked for relief from the demolition delay bylaw. One of the buildings is 47 years old and the other is 60 years old. They have been used mostly as summer rentals. They're cute buildings but they aren't significantly historic.

Polly said the buildings are historic because many young artists moving to town were housed there. John Dowd doesn't feel that they are historically significant.

Marcene said it really needs a site visit. John Dowd said - "Is this something that we want to

preserve?" He continued that these are the worst kinds of designs and are cheaply fabricated buildings. This is nothing that we should preserve as a Board.

After seeing pictures of the proposed new buildings, Steve commented, "So it'll look like a continuation of the Moors complex?" David K said he is trying to create a landscaped look. Painting a great word picture of what he wants. He has enjoyed support from the LHP and John Ryan, the affordable housing guru.

Marcene said she would like Matt Mulvey to see the condition of the buildings and also the HDC should see it. Polly and John disagreed with Marcene. John said - and another thing – we're sitting here and we should be thinking about what the community at large wants us to do.

Motion: Allow the demolition of the two buildings without the 6 month delay.

Motion: John Dowd Seconded: Polly Burnell Vote: 3 in favor, 1 opp (MM) and 0 abstentions.

2007-21

Application by Gerald Ragucci and Robert Foster for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to replace all first floor windows, maintaining original trim and size, add working shutters to all windows on the front (South side) and West side, new rebuild of rear two-story deck and railing with captured 2x2 balusters and new egress and landing, replace existing East and South side porch railing with 2x2 captured balusters, 2x6 pressure treated hand rail and 4x4 pressure treated posts, install new 4 foot rear first and second floor French doors out swinging with 8x8 grille, remove existing chimneys, replace existing chain link fence on West side and deteriorating picket on South side with 3 foot Crosby "Chatham Series" picket and add same fence to the east side from the sidewalk property line to the front building line and add front gates on the East and West side, remove Victorian ornamentation on the front and side porch columns and replace brick and wooden steps with granite at the property located at **240 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

The two above mentioned owners said they purchased the property for two reasons:

1. to get out of the corporate world; and
2. because the building needs a lot of help.

They then presented the revised plans for the 1st floor – a retail floor – they want to do it all over with 2 over 2 windows. There's a 2-story deck in the back that is totally deteriorated. They intend moving it back on the property – in deference to the adjacent church and will maintain the same footprint. The shop will be "high-end" furniture and will be called Chadwick's of Provincetown.

The building began life as a Greek Revival and then it became Victorianized. They were told that they can think of 6 over 6 OR 2 over 2 windows. Either of those choices would be approved.

Matt Mulvey asked if they had looked at what they are spending on the building? Answer: We just applied for the permit that says under a \$1K. Matt said that there is a possibility that the front of the building might have to be made handicap accessible. The ADA says that everybody has to be in compliance with it which would mandate 3 ft wide doorways, lower door handles, etc. These mandates are triggered by the amount of the renovation.

Motion: Accept the plan as proposed.

Motion: John Dowd Seconded: Polly Burnell Vote: 5-0-0.

Case No. 2006-21 - Cape End Manor

Motion: A time extension was granted until February 23, 2008.

Motion: Carol Neal Seconded: Steven Bergquist Vote: 5-0-0.

Cemetery Shed

A plan came in to build a new shed for the Catholic Cemetery. HDC has given permission to demolish the existing shed. The shed - according to an agreement has to be completed by the 28th of May. The plan submitted was quite fancy with a cupola and off-center door, etc. The shed will also contain a shower and bathroom for use by the cemetery workers.

After a little more discussion the following motion was made:

Motion: The shed will have no cupola, the peak of the shed will have to be centered, with a standing-seam roof, walls should be all shingled that will be allowed to age to the silver color. Garage door should be plain with nothing fancy. Also a metal roof since it's a utilitarian type building. John Dowd will mark up the plan in order that it may be presented to Father Dahl defining what is appropriate.

Motion: Polly Burnell Seconded: John Dowd Vote: 4-0-0.

22 Pearl Street

Hal Winard came in to Matt Mulvey with a proposal. He wants to relocate egress stairs. Matt had an old picture of the property and it did have a deck. There is only one apt on the 2nd floor but it has two doors. Hal came in this morning and wondered if the HDC wanted a full-blown hearing. Matt said he'd handle the case. The deck is O.K. – keep stairs to left of door – or to rear.

Minutes

Motion: Accept the minutes of the January 17th meeting as amended.

Motion: Polly Burnell Seconded: John Dowd Vote: 4-0-0.

Motion: Accept the minutes of the March 7th meeting as amended.

Motion: Polly Burnell Seconded: John Dowd Vote: 4-0-0.

Motion: All decisions will be made at the time of the meeting.

Motion: Polly Burnell Seconded: John Dowd Vote: 5-0-0.

Discussion on Election of Officers

Once again this subject was not touched upon.

THE MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:45 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Evelyn Gaudiano

E. Rogers Gaudiano

Approved by _____ on _____, 2007.

John Dowd, Chair