

**Historic District Commission
Meeting of
November 17, 2004, 4:00 PM
Town Hall, Provincetown, MA 02657**

Members Present: John Dowd, Chair; Meg Stewart; Carol Neal; Paul Church; Polly Brunell; and Eric Dray (Alternate)

Town Hall Representatives: Maxine Notaro, Permit Coordinator.

The Work Session commenced at 3:30 PM and John Dowd, introducing the Commission members, opened the Public Hearing at 4:00 PM.

New Cases

Case #2004-093 Application by Edward Malone on behalf of CHR, Inc. for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval for the demolition and reconstruction of an existing structure more than 50 years old that is located outside the Historic District at the property located at **43 Race Point Road, Provincetown, MA.**

Ted Malone explained to the Commission that the building is outside the Historic District but it is greater than 50 years of age. It was a former chicken coop and modified over the years. It was a residence and with storage area on the upper floor and a deli and bike shop on the lower. The new building to be constructed will be within the same footprint.

There were no public comments for or against the demolition and construction of a new building.

Eric Dray did not see that the building warrants saving. A motion was made to accept the application as presented.

Moved by: John Dowd **Seconded by:** Polly Burnell **Yea: 5 Nay: 0**

Case #2004-094 Application by Kevin Bazarian on behalf of 421 Commercial Street Condominium Association for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to remove shingles and trim on the third floor dormers, both sides and replace shingles with vinyl shake style with trim to be 1 x 5 stock solid 3/4 " thick vinyl at the property located at **421 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Kevin Bazarian brought a sample of the vinyl shingles he wants to use to replace the old.

Paul Church brought up the fact that the applicant did not sign the application. Eric Dray read Guideline #12 which applied to this application. Meg Stewart stated that synthetic material should not be allowed.

It was moved to deny the application based on Guideline #12.

Moved by: Meg Stewart **Seconded by:** Paul Church **Yea: 5 Nay: 0**

Case #2004-095 Application by Thomas Capizzi, Jr. on behalf of Frederick Bayer for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to reframe and install three new storefront windows, install 34 replacement windows and install window mantels on top of all windows, rebuild existing third story 14' x 14' deck with weather best and repair and reconstruct existing stairs to upper apartments with weather best at the property located at **188 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Michael Hurley explained the application. The existing windows vary in style with the majority are casement windows. John Dowd felt that 2/2 window would be more appropriate to the unity of the structure and in keeping with the late

Victorian fenestration.

There were no comments from the public regarding this application.

A motion was made to accept the application with the alteration of the door to be a single-pane door rather than a three-pane door. Window caps to be crown molding with 3-½ lineals as in the picture provided. Rails and trim to be wood. The deck to be weather best. All windows will be in the same opening.

Moved by: John Dowd

Seconded by: Polly Burnell

Yea: 4 Nay: 0 Abstained: 1

Paul Church abstained

Case #2004-096 **Application by William N. Rogers, II. P.E. & P.L.S. on behalf of Frederick V. Long** for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to restore and renovate the existing building by lifting the building and replacing the existing brick foundation with a new concrete slab foundation with brick facing on all exposed foundation walls, restore and replace existing windows and doors and remove and replace siding and roofing at the property located at **90 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Gary Locke, for William Rogers, stated that the building dated from the 1800s. It was a bank at one time. It is now in bad shape and does not meet building code. The building will not be enlarged. He is proposing a garage off Mechanic Street and relocate a few of the existing windows and keep them the same size. Solar panels were briefly discussed but will be taken up at a later date.

There were no comments from the public regarding this application.

Meg Stewart asked about the chimney and windows. It was mentioned that they will be 2/1 except those on top will be kept at 2/2. Carol Neal asked about the brick veneer. John Dowd stated that the mortar joints should be made tight to be more realistic. A general discussion regarding the garage addition ensued. Eric Dray wanted to see a door or window put back on the 2nd floor. John Dowd suggested 6/6 windows be used.

John Dowd stated that the Commission has to come to a decision regarding the garage door. Meg Stewart wanted to see it simple and blend in with the façade of the building. Mr. Dowd also suggested that the storefront windows be 9 panes.

There were no comments from the public regarding this application.

A motion was made to accept the application as presented with the following changes: Eliminate the 3rd story façade awning windows. The storefront windows to reflect a nine-grid panel with recessed panel below. Eliminate East façade, 2nd story window on the façade. On rear of the building, replace existing door with a window on the 2nd floor rear. The garage doors are denied at this stage. The railing to be determined by a HDC subcommittee. These items are covered by Guideline #s 5a, b, c, 6b and c, and 10a.

Moved by: John Dowd

Seconded by: Meg Stewart

Yea: 4 Nay: 0 Abstained: 1

Paul Church abstained

Case #2004-097 **Application by John DeSouza on behalf of Timothy Harrington** for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to change two previously approved existing doghouse dormers on the Northeast elevation with one shed dormer partially visible from Commercial and Tremont Streets at the property located at **96 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

John DeSouza presented the application for Timothy Harrington. John Dowd said that the location of the existing dormers sits behind two property lines and is not part of the main house but part of the ell. He has no problem with the application. Carol Neal, after visiting the site, stated that it is highly visible from Commercial Street. The Commission members discussed doghouse dormers vs. shed dormers. One of the issues of concern was the elimination of the existing dog-house dormer.

There were no comments from the public regarding this application.

It was moved to deny the application as submitted based on Guideline #s 2a and 5c.

Moved by: Meg Stewart

Seconded by: Paul Church

Yea: 4 Nay: 1

John Dowd was the negative vote

Case #2004-098 Application by John DeSouza on behalf of Ronald Kollen and Mark Wisneski for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to change the roofline on the entry hall from gable style to porch and add one window above, reshingle the upper portion and add a porch rail and moldings at the property located at 572 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.

Paul Church stepped down from hearing this case. Eric Dray, Alternate, sat in and was able to vote. There was a discussion of the molding around the porch and to make it stronger from an historical standpoint.

There were no comments from the public regarding this application.

It was moved to accept the application with the addition of a fifth window on the 2nd floor, the alteration of the entry vestibule, and to retain the clapboard on the 3rd floor. Guideline #s 5b and 15 cover this.

Moved by: John Dowd

Seconded by: Eric Dray

Yea: 5 Nay: 0

Case #2004-099 Application by Neal Kimball on behalf of Laura Delmolino for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval for the addition of two shed dormers on the North and South elevations and to reinstate the original center entry and landing, remove and reconstruct the existing landing at the secondary front entrance, add and relocate several windows and to add an egress door and stairs at the property located at 12 Franklin Street, Provincetown, MA.

Neal Kimball explained the requested changes and submitted two letters from neighbors approving the project. John Dowd suggested making the windows on the north side the same size. Carol Neal would accept the shed dormer because of the cottage style of the building and it not being a Greek Revival or Victorian building.

There were no comments from the public regarding this application.

A motion was made to accept the proposal as submitted with the alteration of the North elevation and the added window farthest to the West become a single six-light awning to match the 6/6 windows immediately to the East and the installation of a Gothic shutter/fan over the front elevation door windows. This is covered by Guideline #s 5c, 6a, 8s, 9a, b, c and 13.

Moved by: John Dowd

Seconded by: Polly Burnell

Yea: 4 Nay: 0 Abstained: 1

Paul Church abstained

Case #2004-100 Application by Neal Kimball on behalf of Karl Sabinski for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to add a half story to the existing one story cottage, replace all windows with double-hung and repairs to the existing structure as needed to meet structural codes at the property located at 10 Pearl Street, Provincetown, MA.

Neal Kimball explained that the height of the building was reduced by approximately 4' from the height given in his previous plan.

Susan Wasson read a letter signed by a group of neighbors against the project basically because of the height of the new structure. The letter was placed in the Case file.

Meg Stewart stated that one-story structures should remain and particularly in this block in this neighborhood. A one-bedroom cottage can be achieved from a one-story structure. Polly Burnell agreed with Meg Stewart. Eric Dray felt that the design is successful. The issue is whether it should be allowed in this location. John Dowd had no problem with the design. Meg Stewart stated that the neighborhood has to be considered and not only the neighbors. Paul Church agreed and Eric Dray said that the HDC is concerned with design and scale.

John Dowd suggested that a site visit be made after the meeting and to table the vote until then. The Commission members agreed.

A site visit was made at approximately 8:30 PM. John Dowd felt that the additional 3' in height would not be detrimental to the neighborhood and Meg Stewart felt that no change should be made. There was a general discussion regarding the change of scale, especially the height. Eric Dray felt that it was a case of precedent as the building is not historic.

A motion was made to retain the position of the door where it presently is located, make the window larger and the door on the side removed and replaced with a window and the dormer removed from the design.

Moved by: John Dowd **Seconded by:** Carol Neal **Yea: 3 Nay: 2**
Meg Stewart and Polly Burnell were the negative votes

Case #2004-101 Application by Ted Chapin on behalf of David M. King for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to reduce a three family dwelling to a single family dwelling, relocate and replace windows, replace and add doors, install a skylight, replace roofing and siding and remove and reconstruct the existing chimney at the property located at **2 Daggert Lane, Provincetown, MA.**

Ted Chapin, presenting the application, said that there was some visibility and the building is on a private lane. He explained the details of the application.

There were no comments from the public regarding this application.

A motion was made to approve the application as presented.

Moved by: John Dowd **Seconded by:** Meg Stewart **Yea: 5 Nay: 0**

Case #2004-102 Application by John Reis Inc. d/b/a Golden Hammer on behalf of Patty Deluca for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to add a shed dormer 29' 8" at the property located at **4 Franklin Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Lisa Meads presented the case for John Reis. Meg Stewart stated that she was concerned with the mass of the structure. Other suggestions of changes were made to the applicant who agreed to them.

There were no comments from the public regarding this application.

A motion was made to approve the application as presented with the following changes: Retaining of bands and the two right windows to match the two on the left in size. The windows will be wood with true divided light. These changes are covered by Guideline #s 5c, 8a and 8c.

Moved by: John Dowd **Seconded by:** Polly Burnell **Yea: 3 Nay: 0 Abstained: 2**
Paul Church and Meg Stewart abstained

Case #2004-103 Application by Tom Burke and Axel Brunger on behalf of Gwendolyn Willard for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to add dormers and skylights, extend a second floor over the existing first floor addition, replace all windows and doors and add new

windows and doors and new roof at the property located at **27 Tremont Street, Provincetown, MA.**

John Hopkins was present to help Tom Burke present the application. Mr. Burke stated that the house is on a private way.

Meg Stewart and Eric Dray felt that the dormers are too large. John Dowd agreed. They felt the elevation should be kept as it is. The suggestion was to bring in the sides of the dormers. The dormers are covered under Guideline #s 5a and 6b. Eric Dray stated that turning the side elevation into a front elevation was against Guideline 6b. Meg Stewart felt that altering a simple, pristine property goes against HDC principals.

Meg Stewart would not approve the application.

The foundation will be changed using old bricks. John Dowd made suggestions to Mr. Burke regarding changes that would not be visible from a public way.

A motion was made to approve the application as amended: The shed dormer to be made smaller to match length of existing windows below. Two skylights will be changed to one skylight. An egress door will replace ell window in lieu of being centered on East location. The roof on the ell will be lowered to match primary roof pitch on main house. The chimney will be moved from center to back of dormer as shown on plans and will retain its current size and shape. The brick foundation will use existing old bricks.

Eric Dray suggested amending the motion by stating that new, scaled drawings to be redone of the particular elevation and to be reviewed by a subcommittee.

The changes are covered by Guideline #s 5a,6b, 8s, b and c, and 15.

There were no comments from the public regarding this application.

Moved by: Paul Church

Seconded by: John Dowd

Yea: 4 Nay: 1

Meg Stewart voted against.

At the site visit on Pearl Street, after the vote (see above Case #2004-100), a motion was made to adjourn the meeting at 9:00 PM.

Moved by: John Dowd

Seconded by: Meg Stewart

Yea: 5 Nay: 0

Respectfully submitted by

Joel Glasser

Recording Secretary

Approved by: _____ on _____
John Dowd, Chairman Date