

**Historic District Commission
Meeting of
September 15, 2004, 4:00 PM
Town Hall, Provincetown, MA 02657**

Members Present: John Dowd, Chairman; Meg Stewart; Polly Burnell; Carol Neal; Paul Church; Tom Boland (Alternate), and Eric Dray (Alternate)

Town Hall Representatives: Maxine Notaro, Permit Coordinator.

The Work Session commenced at 3:30 PM.

Work Session

Request for Administrative Approvals

1. Roman Catholic Bishop of Fall River – **11 Prince Street** - Roofing permit to replace shingles with a better grade of shingle from the present white ones to gray. This was unanimously approved.
2. Joe Neumeister – **139A Bradford Street** – Roofing permit. This was unanimously approved.
3. Deborah Paine – **528 Commercial Street** – Remove existing roof and replace in kind. This was unanimously approved.

Review of Previous Cases

1. Hazel Warner, **269A Bradford Street** – Replace windows previously approved. Ms. Warner requested an extension of time on her permit as it is six months old. There was a discussion as to how much time would be appropriate to grant. A decision was made to extend the permit for one year. This was unanimously approved.
2. Neal Kimball on behalf of Anthony Price and Kirk Carter, **11 Cottage Street** – Amended plans. Neal Kimball explained the amended plans using the suggestions of the Commission made at the last meeting. It was moved to approve the plans as submitted with the following changes made on the plans dated September 8th, 2004.
 - *East Elevation* – Kitchen ell, two outer walls and shed roof will be removed and reconstructed on same footprint. Floors will be reconstructed. Foundation with existing red brick wall will remain. Reinforcement will be from inside. Chimneys will be replicated in original design and location with replicated old brick. Replace and relocate windows on East elevation as per Guidelines 5b and c and shown on plan. Deck on second floor as shown on drawing is approved. The addition of roof deck, as shown on drawing, is covered by Guidelines 9a, c and 13.
 - *West Elevation* – Approve door trim as shown on drawing; replace cedar shingles with cedar clapboard as shown on drawing. Relocation of two windows and addition of two doghouse dormers (covered by Guideline 8a).
 - *South Elevation* – Addition of window as shown on drawing.
 - *North Elevation* – Approval of two skylights (covered by Guideline 8c) as shown on drawing and relocation of one window and addition of three more windows as per the drawing (covered by Guidelines 5b and c).

Moved by: Meg Stewart

Seconded by: John Dowd

Yea: 5 Nay: 0

3. Robert Valois on behalf of Jane Gildersleeve, **30 Alden Street**. Amended plans. Polly Burnell stepped down.

New drawings were submitted and approval stamp was placed on them.

Public Hearing – New Cases

Case #2004-070 **Application by Jeanne Brouillette and Nancy Larkham** for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to replace five (5) windows with five (5) one over one (1/1) vinyl replacement windows at the property located at **480 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

A motion was made to approve replacement of five windows with vinyl 1/1 windows in accordance with Guideline 5a.

Moved by: Paul Church

Seconded by: Polly Burnell

Yea: 5 Nay: 0

Case #2204-071 **Application by Donna Flax** in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter Donna Flax for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to demolish the existing garage and relocate the Fine Arts Work Center cottage previously approved for demolition of existing garage on footprint at the property located at **5 Fishburn Court, Provincetown, MA.**

John Hopkins of Augustus Construction explained the demolition of the garage and the relocation of the cottage. The applicants still have to appear before the Zoning Board. There were no public comments regarding this application.

A motion was made to accept the proposal to demolish the garage structure and to replace it with a cottage at 6 Fishburn Court. The demolition is approved as the garage is marginally visible and significantly deteriorated which is why the HDC is not asking for a certificate from the Building Commissioner. Guidelines 14 and 15 cover this.

Moved by: John Dowd

Seconded by: Polly Burnell

Yea: 4 Nay: 1
Paul Church opposed

Case #2004-072 **Application by Neal Kimball on behalf of Jerry Clare** for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval for the construction of a new two-story single-family dwelling on a vacant lot at the property located at **28 Commercial Street**, which is accessed from **Point Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Neal Kimball stated that the intention of construction was to keep the building as compact as could be. The North and South elevations would be visible. Footprint of house is small because of restrictions. 6/6 windows are Anderson woodscape, interior/exterior with divided light.

The public was asked for comments and Roger Haynes of 21 Point Street had no objections. Julie Goodritch, an abutter, worried about fitting the house into surrounding community such as being top tall. She was concerned about house being too big.

John Dowd closed the public comment portion and the Commission members were asked for comments and questions. Tom Boland stated that he did not find anything bad in the design and would like to compare it with what is almost immediately adjacent to the property.

Eric Dray stated that he looks at the fenestration pattern. He feels that the inside of this cottage is dictating the outside design. The South and North elevations were articulated very well and he asked if the East elevation could be improved.

Polly Brunell felt that the building is too large for the street that mostly contains small cottages. Paul Church agreed with Ms Brunell and was concerned with the character of the neighborhood and would like to see the building blend in more with the Goodritch cottage. John Dowd agreed with the other members of the Commission and stated that the house seems more than what is needed and should be brought more in line with the neighbors. Carol Neal and Meg Stewart also agreed and would scale the building down and thought that it is too high and both feel that it should be lowered.

A motion was made to continue this Case until the next meeting, October 6th, 2004. It is based on Guideline 15.

Moved by: John Dowd

Seconded by: Polly Burnell

Yea: 5 Nay: 0

Note: Tom Boland had to leave the meeting at 5:45 PM.

Case #2004-073 **Application by Construction Management Services on behalf of ComCast** for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to demolish the existing 20' x 32' structure and reconstruct a new 20' x 32' ranch style dwelling within the existing footprint at the property located at **36 Shank Painter Road, (ComCast Building), Provincetown, MA.**

Eric Dray stated that the building is in the historic district and a determination should be made if the building is significant. If it is determined so, then the Demolition Delay By-law has to be invoked.

The applicant wants to remove the building and erect a new building on the existing foundation so there would be no need for a long handicap ramp.

A motion was made that the building is not significant within the meaning of the Demolition Delay By-law.

Moved by: John Dowd

Seconded by: Polly Burnell

Yea: 4 Nay: 1

Paul Church opposed

Case #2004-074 **Application by John DeSouza on behalf of David Brown** for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to remove a non-historic one car garage, remove vinyl and aluminum siding on main dwelling and restore with shingles and clapboards, replace and repair fences and construct a fence and gate at the back of the patio area at the property located at **4 Winslow Street, Provincetown, MA.**

John DeSouza and the owner, David Brown, want to: Remove all aluminum and vinyl siding and restore wood to the original appearance; remove garage; and, repair and replace fences around the property.

Meg Stewart did not agree with the privacy fencing. Carol Neal did not agree with the eight-foot fence. John Dowd suggested that the same fencing be used on three sides to unify it. The other Commission members agreed.

Regarding the demolition of the garage, Eric Dray had no problem with the demolition of this structure. Polly Brunell agreed even though she has strong feelings about any demolition. Paul Church did not agree with the demolition just to have more space. John Dowd stated that by demolishing the garage it lets the building have more space and be viewed. Carol Neal agreed and was against the demolition and referred to Guideline 14. Meg Stewart agreed with Paul Church and does not agree with the demolition of structures.

A motion was made to accept the 6' plank fence on three sides behind the façade of the building and graduate it down from the façade to the street line. The fence on the street elevation will have a capped rail fence, 21", with equal spaced pickets and the Commission agrees to the demolition of the garage for extraordinary circumstances: It is an accessory structure not significant to the 1780 house on the site; and, it appears to have lost its original features of the 1920s era. The removal of vinyl and aluminum siding to restore house to its original appearance subject to restoring original details and trim if found in any historic photograph.

Moved by: John Dowd

Seconded by: Carol Neal

Yea: 3 Nay: 2

Meg Stewart and Paul Church opposed.

Case #2004-075 **Application by John DeSouza on behalf of Damon Leard and Robert Tracy** for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to replace

windows, extend sunroom and add roof deck, extend 2nd story ell and add roof decks and studio, remove skylights and metal flue, replace sliders with bay windows and French doors, and the addition of a traditional style doorway with entry hood to create a secondary egress at the property located at **7 Carver Street, Provincetown, MA.**

John DeSouza and Damon Leard handed out copies of the proposed alterations with an explanation and spoke about each of the alterations.

Meg Stewart had to leave the meeting at 7:25 PM and Alternate Eric Dray sat in.

Public comments were asked for and there were none.

John Dowd made suggestions about the roof deck, front door and other facades of the house. Polly Brunell commented on the number of windows on the South elevation. Eric Dray as well as Carol Neal stated that they were concerned with the North elevation. The members stated that they would have a problem if the façade was visible.

A motion was made to approve this Case as submitted with the following changes: West elevation restoration of corner boards and other decorations; South elevation extension of sun porch with windows as shown on the plan with the revision that rail on 2nd floor extends to meet the slope of the roof and the remainder of extension ell be based on minimum degree of visibility on the South elevation; North elevation addition and relocation of windows approved pursuant to Guideline 5c. Approval of ell and shed dormer with provision that two shuttered windows be added centered over the back two.

Moved by: Eric Dray

Seconded by: Polly Burnell

Yea: 4 Nay: 0 Abstained: 1
Paul Church abstained.

Case #2004-076 Application by Sprinkle Home Improvement on behalf of Karen Click and Nancy McLane for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to remove eight wood double-hung windows with storm windows and install eight white vinyl replacement style windows with grids and remove the existing entry door and replace with a new fiberglass primary door with same grid count at the property located at **383 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Brad Sprinkle appeared for the applicant. He said that four windows face the street and four face an alley. Six are 12/8 and two are 8/8. He wants to change the white wood to white vinyl. The fiberglass door would be a 12 light door.

Eric Dray stated that vinyl doors are generally not acceptable by the Historic District Commission.

Mr. Sprinkle said that there would be external factory applied muntins on the windows.

John Dowd asked for any public comments. Ted Shaefer, a resident of the condominium complex, spoke and felt that the design standards should be made by the condominium association not an individual resident and was against the proposal. He also felt that the condominium residents should appear before the HDC as a unit.

There was a general discussion of replacement of wooden windows with vinyl windows.

A motion was made to allow eight double hung windows and replace them with white vinyl windows with three-dimensional trapezoidal external muntins. The four on front are 12/8; two in rear are 12/8; and the other two in the rear are 8/8. Eric Dray would like to see a manufacturer's spec such as a catalog page.

It was moved to accept the above and replace the wood door in kind.

Moved by: Polly Burnell

Seconded by: Meg Stewart

Yea: 4 Nay: 1
Paul Church opposed

New Business

After some discussion a motion was made to empower the Commission members or Maxine Notaro to sign certificates.

Moved by: John Dowd

Seconded by: Polly Burnell

Yea: 5 Nay: 0

-

Minutes

A motion was made to accept the minutes of the September 1, 2004 meeting as corrected.

Moved by: Eric Dray

Seconded by: Paul Church

Yea: 4 Nay: 0 Abstained: 1
John Dowd Abstained

A motion was made to adjourn the meeting at 8:25 PM.

Moved by: Paul Church

Seconded by: Carol Neal

Yea: 5 Nay: 0

Respectfully submitted by
Joel Glasser
Recording Secretary

Approved by: _____ on _____
John Dowd, Chairman Date