

**HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
PUBLIC MEETING
Town Hall
Provincetown MA
WEDNESDAY, AUGUST 7, 2019**

Members Present: Thomas Biggert (TB), Chairman, Pilgrim Monument Rep.; Laurie Delmolino (LD), Historical Commission Rep.; Hersh Schwartz (HS), Chamber of Commerce Rep.; John Dowd (JD), PBG Rep.; Christopher Mathieson (CM), PAAM Rep.;

Excused Absences: Michela Carew-Murphy, Alternate.

Unexcused Absence: Martin Risteen, Alternate.

Others Present: Annie Howard (AH), Building Commissioner.

Work Session: VOTES MAY BE TAKEN

1. Update on potential violations reported to the Building Commissioner.

AH responded that item #2 on the Agenda would be before the Board and also reported that 552 Commercial St. had made application on Monday.

2. Determination as to whether the applications below involve any Exterior Architectural Features within the jurisdiction of the Commission; with Full Reviews to be placed on the Public Hearing agenda of September 4, 2019 and Administrative Reviews to be acted on by a subcommittee appointed by the Commission.

i. 156 Bradford St. – To replace roofing shingles

AH said the work was done during the heat wave and was not the Sears-Roebuck house as assumed by CM.

TB made a motion to approve as presented. CM seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; TB, CM, HS, JD.

ii. 620 Commercial St. – To replace a fence in kind.

TB remarked that the lattice fence was just installed to which AH said was in kind.

TB made a motion to approve as presented. JD seconded the motion and it passed,

4-0-0; TB, JD, HS, CM.

iii. 4 Anthony St., UB – To replace trim with Bodyguard.

AH said she was surprised to walk by and see the working being finished up as they had been on the Agenda a few months ago. LD asked after Bodyguard, which AH said is the pine from New Zealand, a controlled growth substance.

TB made a motion to approve as presented. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, CM.

iv. 192-194 Commercial St., #4 (continued from the meeting of July 17th to determine visibility from a public way.)

The Board determined from its site visit that it could not be seen from a public way.

TB made a motion to approve as presented. CM seconded the motion and it passed,

5-0-0; TB, CM, LD, HS, JD.

v. 210 Bradford St. – To replace roofing shingles.

LD responded to CM that the water-shields to be installed would be underneath and unseen.

TB made a motion to approve as presented. JD seconded the motion and it passed 5-0-0; TB, JD, LD, HS, CM.

vi. 200 Commercial St. – To replace 3 display windows.

Hal Winard presented; said windows would be the same size and identical.

TB made a motion to approve as presented. LD seconded the motion and it passed,

5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, CM.

vii. 590 Commercial St. – To replace 2 patio doors in kind.

TB noted Anderson A-Series replacement doors.

TB made a motion to approve as presented. LD seconded the motion and it passed,

5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, CM.

viii. 178 Bradford St. – To replace 6 windows in kind.

TB noted full divided-lite. AH read the specs on the replacement materials. After discussion and review of the application it appeared the replacements are not true but simulated divided-lite, but it was decided that they could also be acceptable.

TB made a motion to approve as presented. LD seconded the motion and it passed,

5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, CM.

ix. 56 Commercial St. – To replace a deck in kind.

Mr. Murphy and Mr. Santos presented. Mr. Santos said that his goal in 2014 was to replace both the top and bottom decks, but for financial reasons, he only replaced the bottom deck at that time; now wants to match the top to the bottom. Mr. Murphy said it would be done up to building code and be all-wood.

TB made a motion to approve as presented. LD seconded the motion and it passed,

5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, CM.

x. 14 Center St., UF – To replace deck boards and railings and replace front door steps.

TB noted pressure-treated and mahogany aspects, and remarked it was much-improved over the existing.

TB made a motion to approve as presented. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, CM.

TB made a motion to consider 7 Conwell St., 5 Conwell St. and 9 Point St. for Full Review. CM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, CM, LD, HS, JD.

TB remarked that there were not drawings of the existing structure for either 7 Conwell St. and 9 Point St. AH dispersed the drawings she had in the file for 7 Conwell St., after which TB concluded that there was enough information for 7 Conwell St. to proceed with the Full Review.

AH talked through the application requests for 9 Point St. where it was decided the French door

would not be seen.

3. **Any other business that shall properly come before the Commission:**

None.

4. **Public Comments: On any matter not on the agenda below.**

None.

5. **Public Hearings: VOTES MAY BE TAKEN**

TB opened the Public Hearing at 4:02pm; mentioned a problem with getting relevant materials into the packets in a timely fashion.

a. HDC 19-249 (continued from the meeting of July 17th)

Application by **Ezra Block**, on behalf of **Matt Metivier** and **Ricardo Gessa**, requesting to renovate a cottage on the property located at **7 Bradford Street**.

LD recused herself.

Ezra Block, architect, presented from plans dated July 25, 2019.

JD and CM noted that the plans conveyed all that the HDC had asked for and looked

great. TB asked about various window placements, including window B which had been requested for double-hungs as a fixed window. CM said he was alright with the change, as did JD, TB & HS.

TB made a motion to approve as presented. JD seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; TB, JD, HS, CM.

b. HDC 19-270

Application by **William N. Rogers, II**, on behalf of **New Hop Holdings, LLC**, requesting to renovate a structure, including putting a one-story addition on the first floor to replace an existing outdoor stair entrance, extending a first floor deck on the east elevation and adding egress stairs, and adding two dormers and a new second floor inset deck on the south elevation at the property located at **429 Commercial Street**.

Lester J. Murphy, Jr., attorney, presented; said the request was for a continuance as work on the front of the building is still on-going.

TB made a motion to accept the time waiver for case HDC 19-270. CM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, CM, LD, HS, JD.

TB made a motion to continue the decision to the meeting of September 4, 2019. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, HS, LD, JD, CM.

c. HDC 19-272

Application by **William N. Rogers, II**, on behalf of **Noho Properties, LLC**, requesting to repair and replace an existing stair system on the north elevation of a structure located at **452 Commercial Street**.

Gary Locke presented; reviewed HDC-adopted changes, including railing replacement, 2x3 cross rails and rounded railing.

TB asked why the design still appeared bulky. Mr. Locke said the railing isn't carrying the load but the second floor deck has a need of 42" based on Code.

TB made a motion to approve as presented. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, CM.

d. HDC 19-277 (continued from the meeting of July 17th)

Application by **Mark Kinnane, of Cape Associates, Inc.**, on behalf of **Barry Peskin**, requesting to install a new fence to match an existing fence at the property located at **11 Brewster Street**.

Mark Kinnane presented; said if they cannot have the fence then they must put up a railing; included alternates in his current plans. TB stated his preference for the option with mahogany and captured balusters. Mr. Kinnane said the railing would protect the dogs on the property. CM asked if the addition was a railing or a fence and it was determined to be a railing.

TB made a motion to approve as presented with captured wood balusters. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, CM.

e) HDC 19-289

Application by **Ted Smith, Architect, LLC**, on behalf of **James & Doree Price**, requesting to demolish a structure located at **21 Off Cemetery Road**.

Ted Smith presented; said the new structures would be a two-car garage and a residence at the back of the property to give the owners more privacy directly off the road.

No public comments or letters.

Discussion followed on the placement of vents and septic. Mr. Smith said there are no current plans for the new garage, but that the owners have stated a preference for stone over brick, with no mention of picket fencing. TB recommended a demolition delay for the HDC to do due diligence on a building over 50 years old.

TB made a motion to approve as presented. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, CM.

TB spoke of the recent approved demolition delay at 425 Commercial St. which AH said was not subjected to demolition delay as it is within the Historic District. TB said the HDC had allowed the building to be destroyed even as there was interest in moving the structure and that the lesson to be learned is that it is up to the Board to thoroughly investigate a building and its options in such circumstances and to not rely on the owners to do what is in the best interests of the Historic District. LD and JD both agreed that the Board can take a stronger hand in determinations.

f) HDC 20-003

Application by **Lester J. Murphy, Esq.**, on behalf of **18 Bangs Street, LLC**, requesting to replace doors, windows, siding, trim, and roofing shingles, to construct a new roof deck and foundation, and to rebuild an existing deck on the structure located at **18 Bangs Street**.

Lester Murphy presented; said the applicants are proposing a significant upgrade of the 4- unit structure which will be reduced to a 2-unit structure and have a new foundation; most of work done manually and no plans for a heavy crane on the grounds; asphalt shingle roof and vinyl siding will be replaced with a preference for clapboard front side and cedar on the others, if permitted; windows are rotting, falling apart, new window schedule has been submitted; roof deck is for the first floor of the building and not on a higher plane.

Ben Stone of 19 Bangs St. spoke from the public and said he thought he would be objecting to the roof deck but that it now looks to be an improvement.

Charles Sousa of 17 Bangs St. spoke, said No. 18 had been in his family's hands up

until the current owner and said that while he is against a roof deck if the plan is to match the current location over the first floor then he is okay with it.

TB read a letter of concern from Karen dePalma at 190 Bradford St., requesting the applicant post a bond for the forthcoming work based on past damage done to her own property.

JD said he found the window replacement an unattractive option for the existing and that the front façade has an elegant look to it; suggested moving the door location back to where it was centrally placed to help the new design plan. CM said he agreed with JD and that clapboards would help, said he liked the odd two windows on the upper space and that the general look was that of an art studio which is being lost in the current design. LD said the amount of negative space at hand is to the detriment of the house, recommended an alternate placement of the door and window.

Lyn Plummer spoke of the design plan and offered to make changes as recommended by the HDC, including eliminating side-lights and putting the door back to its original position and maintain the windows as 6-over-6s on the south and east elevations; and a solid door.

TB made a motion to approve as presented with the following conditions: windows on south and east elevations be 6-over-6s; north elevation windows be 2-over-2s; solid door on east elevation be moved back to original position and sidelights be eliminated; entire structure be clad in shingles; captured balusters on new deck; wood trim. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, CM.

Mr. Murphy said new plans would be provided.

g) HDC 20-004

Application by **Stephen Magliocco**, on behalf of **John Livingstone & Joanne Gaffney Livingstone**, requesting to renovate an existing cottage by adding a sunroom, new windows and a shed dormer on the property located at **522 Commercial Street**.

Lester J. Murphy, Esq. and Stephen Magliocco presented with John and Joanne Livingstone in the audience. Mr. Magliocco said the re-vamp will include gray cedar architectural shingles, 2-over-2s, black simulated divided lites, shed dormer replacement, removal of second floor deck to face back into the lot.

TB read a letter in support from the resident at 523 Commercial St. and another in support from abutter Regina Binder at 523 Commercial St., Unit #4.

LD noted the most visible facades as north and west, south not at all; said she felt the design went well with the HDC guidelines but asked after the bump-out or projected Bay. Mr. Magliocco stated this as a design decision, to which LD said these are usually drawn at 2' and suggested eliminating the element would render the home more historic.

HS said she felt it was very well planned. CM said the floor comes across as a disconnect from the typical Cape Cod classic look, suggested re-arrangement of windows. Mr. Magliocco replied that they weren't looking to fashion after a traditional Cape Cod and that the window suggestion could be problematic. JD said he found the photo supplied of the west elevation very useful and that his initial concerns have been answered for the contemporary structure.

TB said he appreciated the Bradford St. elevation but that the other elevation should be simplified, to which JD argued a balance had been achieved. CM added that replacing the vinyl fence would also be a good remedy. HDC debated the bump-out further. TB suggested the problem might be the presence of four different size windows and variations on window placements were discussed.

TB made a motion to approve as presented with the condition that the window on the second floor of the north elevation match the size on the first floor and the bump out on the west elevation be eliminated; wood trim and captured balusters. CM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, CM, LD, HS, JD.

Mr. Magliocco said he would have the new drawings in two weeks' time. JD asked about the awning which was then briefly examined.

TB announced a five-minute break at 5:40pm.

CM left the meeting at 5:45pm.

h) HDC 20-006

Application by **KA Bazarian**, on behalf of **Jason Chapman**, requesting to connect two cottages and add new rear additions to each, replace windows and doors, and rebuild decks on the property located at **19 Winthrop Street**.

Kevin Bazarian, Jason Chapman, owner, and Lyn Plummer presented. Mr. Bazarian said the idea was to add a connector between the two cottages so that Mr. Chapman will be able to connect to his bedroom; raised roof to a shed-type and a bump-out to install a fireplace.

TB read four letters in support: owner and trustee, Peter McBride (sp) at Unit #2; abutters, Brad Blake and Barry Golden; Shelley Jennings at 17 Winthrop St.; Anthony in Unit #1.

JD asked why the west elevation was all doors. Mr. Chapman replied that it would give a look of symmetry to the front façade; noted a slider that would lead to the master bedroom. Ms.

Plummer said the design also allows for light to enter the space and Mr. Bazarian mentioned a 6' fence in front. Mr. Chapman said the neighbors are pushing to have clapboards in front.

TB observed that most of the west elevation can be seen from a public way but the other three elevations hardly, if at all; suggested the design has rendered the cottages too fancy. AH gave a run-down of the window configuration including sliders and fixed, egress units. Ms. Plummer said the windows are 53 high by 29 wide. LD agreed that even with everything getting bigger and taller it can still retain some of its simplicity; offered an alternative involving window spacing and stated that a slider on the front of a cottage as not being historical, advocated skylights as a way to bring in light. HS said she didn't have any concerns thus far.

JD said that he understood the design in terms of the applicant's desire for contemporary living, but cited the HDC's mandate of historical perspective as running counter to the plan which he found overly formal. TB agreed and suggested relocating the slider. Other options were explored and an arrangement found to be agreeable by all.

Mr. Chapman said he is proposing 2-over-2s, in terms of windows to match the neighbors, but that he would be amendable to 2-over-1s; preferred not to do 2-over-6s. JD recommended a change in the door allocations.

TB made a motion to approve as presented with the following conditions: side-lights be removed from the center door; right cottage door remain with two double-hung windows; structure to be all shingles, no clapboards; eliminate panels below windows; door on the right be a Provincetown Door; 2-over-1 true divided-lite windows. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD.

Mr. Chapman said they would get the HDC new plans of the west elevation and added that the project has been 14 years in the making.

i. HDC 20-010

Application by **Brad Mayeux**, on behalf of **Jay Abbiuso**, requesting to add a garage and relocate windows on the structure located at **286 Bradford Street**.

4th AH related the applicant's request to postpone the decision to the meeting of September due to an emergency.

TB made a motion to postpone the decision to the meeting of September 4, 2019. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD.

LD requested that AH notify the applicant that the HDC needs current plans.

6. Review and approval of Minutes:

TB made a motion to approve the meeting minutes of June 4, 2019. JD seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; TB, JD, LD, HS.

7. Deliberations on Pending Decisions: VOTES MAY BE TAKEN

TB made a motion to approve the decision of HDC 19-274, 328 Commercial St., written by TB and read into the record by TB as approved on July 17, 2019. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; TB, HS, LD, JD.

TB made a motion to approve the decision of HDC 19-284, 6 Pearl St., #A, written by LD and read into the record by LD as approved on July 17, 2019. JD seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; TB, JD, LD, HS.

TB made a motion to approve the decision of HDC 19-244, 25 Watson Ct., written by MCM and read into the record by HS as approved on June 5, 2019. TB seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; HS, TB, LD, MR.

The above approved decisions are to be filed with the Town Clerk's office by HS on August 9, 2019.

AH referenced an application concerning approval of cable railing at 214A Commercial St. that had fallen through the cracks. Brief discussion followed.

Decisions to be written as follows: HDC 19-277, 11 Brewster St. by TB; HDC 20-003, 18 Bangs St. by LD; HDC 20-004, 522 Commercial St. by HS; HDC 20-006, 19 Winthrop St. by JD.

TB made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 6:37pm. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; TB, HS, LD, JD.

Respectfully Submitted,
Jody O'Neil



OCT 16, 2019