

**Town of Provincetown
Visitor Services Board
Meeting Minutes from April 11th, 2017, 3:00 pm
Town Hall, Judge Welsh Room
260 Commercial Street
Provincetown, MA 02657**



Members present: Marian Peck - Chair, Hersh Schwartz – Vice Chair, Lesley Marchessault, Regina Cassidy, Dan Vanwaus, Rick Murray – conference call, Bob Sanborn – conference call.

Members absent: none

Meeting was called to order at 3:00 pm by Marian Peck.

Staff: Anthony Fuccillo, Radu Luca.

Others: David Panagore – Town Manager, Candy Collins-Boden – Chamber of Commerce Executive Director

Agenda:

1. Public Statements—Five minutes maximum. Board members are not obligated to respond to Public Statements

DP – here to speak as Chief Procurement Office for the Town of Provincetown and cover the Communications Agency Proposals. Red Thread was the top scoring agency.

Memo

To: Visitor Services Board
From: David B. Panagore
Date: April 11, 2017
Re: Request for Proposals for Communication Services for the Office of Tourism

The Town released a Request for Proposals (RFP) from qualified consulting firms for comprehensive public relations and communication services for the Provincetown Tourism Office. Proposals were due on March 6, 2017.

As Chief Procurement Officer, I selected and designated a committee to conduct the interview and evaluation process of the non-price proposals. The committee members are three members of the Visitor Services Board: Rita "Hersh" Schwartz, Rick Murray, Marian Peck and one staff person, Nick Robertson. My Executive Assistant, Elisabeth Verde, chaired the committee and facilitated the process, but was not a voting member of the committee.

Based on the criterion included in the RFP, the committee developed scoring system with weights for each of the seven evaluation criterion. The lowest possible score was 1 point and the highest possible score was 3 points. On March 14th and 16th, the RFP review committee met and interviewed the four qualifying proposers. The committee then met again to evaluate the non-price proposals. The committee ranked the proposals as follows:

- | | |
|---------------------------|---------------|
| 1. Red Thread | Score of 2.7 |
| 2. Green Rubino | Score of 2.32 |
| 3. O'Neill and Associates | Score of 1.48 |
| 4. Addison Agency | Score of 1.04 |

I subsequently accepted their recommendations and then opened the price proposals. As ranked by the committee, the price proposals are as follows:

Proposer	Pricing
Red Thread	They propose \$108,000 per year in account management and creative development. This would be \$324,000 for a 3 year fixed contract. This does not include travel expenses.
Green Rubino	They propose \$172,000 for the first year. This includes initial fees of \$100,000 for plan, concept and implementation. Managing the account would cost \$6000 per month. A three year contract, based on management fees only being charged in the second and third years would equal a total contract of \$316,000 . This does not include travel expenses.
O'Neill and Associates	They propose \$115,000 per year, the equivalent of \$345,000 for a three year contract. They also suggest a social media audit and implementation for \$7500 and estimate \$27,000 per year in miscellaneous costs that include travel.
Addison Agency	They propose an hourly rate of \$150 per hour and do not wish to enter into a multi-year contract.

As there are budget implications, I am asking the VSB for your advice and input before I make my recommendation to the Board of Selectmen at their April 13, 2017 Special Meeting.

RM – The Town Manager’s Executive Assistant did a great job providing information and steering the Committee in the right direction. Would like to ask the rest of the VSB to accept the recommendation made by the Committee, which 3 VSB members were part of. Presented a list of budgeted publications and grants budget the VSB could decide to reallocate and cover for the costs of the new Communications

Agency. The publications include: Towleroad, HotSpots, Clear Channel, tourism grants budget, radio, 2020.

JC – the Committee put a lot of work into this process, but she’s new to the board and would like to differ.

HS – believes the VSB could easily knock down \$50k from various currently earmarked publications and grants, but would not cut funding for billboards.

DP – doesn’t believe the funds allocated to 2020 should be reduced.

LM – would like to see copies of the proposals.

2. Tourism Director Report

VSB 2017 TOURISM FUND			COMMENTS
Revised March 30, 2017			
Marketing Fund Balance 6/30/16	8,228		\$1393 unused \$6835 PCC grant unused
Marketing Fund Budget 2017	335,000		
Available Marketing Funds 2017	343,228		
COMMITTED BUDGET DOLLARS			COMMENTS
Chamber Co-op	20,000		
PBG Co-op	20,000		
Provincetown 2020	15,000		Earmark 2017
Graphic Artist	15,000		Annual Contract
PR Firm	40,000		Annual Contract
Art News	7,300		Top 200 Collectors 4th quarter
Giant Adirondack Chair	3,448		Ordered - Shipping 21 Sept
Radio	34,000		Fall \$16,000 Spring \$18,000
American Art Collector	2,600		July Cape & Islands issue
EDGE Media Network	9,000		Fiscal 17 July - June
Boston Globe Media	17,835		Fiscal 17 July - June
Photo Shoots	5,600		5 shoots
MILO Interactive	798		Annual Website Hosting
Tote Bags	14,340		12,000 bags \$12,840 Shipping up to \$1,500
Update Kiosks	2,000		Spend up to \$2000 to enhance kiosks
CMI	2,000		Registration & Travel
OutFront Media	8,500		Outdoor Billboards
Boston Concierge & Boston Spirit	1,000		Trade Shows
Dallas Voice	1,360		Pride Issue September
Boston Globe Travel Show	2,970		Plus electric, shipping & travel
Cape Cod Travel Guide	3,750		Full Page next to Table of Contents
IGLTA Banner	3,999		Quarterly ads on line
Social Media	20,000		
Boston Spirit Magazine	5,400		3 half page ads and newsletters
CapeCod.com CCBM	1,080		
Bird's Eye View	3,900		6 issues Nov - Oct
New England Tourism Ctr & EC Travel	2,239		Canada Representation and 1/2 page ad
Cape Cod Chamber of Commerce	295		annual dues
American Bus Association	664		annual dues
MA US Route 6 Tourist Association	250		annual dues
IGLTA Membership Dues	790		annual dues
Greater Boston Concierge Assoc	275		annual dues
Brochure Printing & Distribution	4,850		Events Calendar and Rack Card
Destinations Group Travel	2,410		ABA Publication
Clear Channel	10,000		Outdoor Billboards
CBS WBZ	5,500		Geo-Farming
HotSpots	10,155		Annual Print and Digital Campaign
Curve	3,750		Digital Campaign
Out Film CT	1,100		Film Festival Sponsorship
Gay & Lesbian Review Worldwide	6,696		6 back cover
Daytrips & Destiantions/Hartford Mag	2,000		Trade Show & May/June half page ad
Yankee Magazine	2,950		1/3 page ad in Best of New England issue
Cape Cod Times	2,500		
Total Committed Dollars	317,304		
Available Funds	25,924		

ADVERTISING VEHICLES 2017	PLAN SPEND	COMMITTED	PROJECTED
American Art Collector	\$2,500	\$2,600	\$2,600
ARTNews	\$7,500	\$7,300	\$7,300
Out CT Film Festival Program	\$1,000	\$1,100	\$1,100
Provincetown 2020	\$15,000	\$15,000	\$15,000
Summer Guide-Best Read Guide	\$1,000		\$0
Boston Globe Magazine and.com	\$15,000	\$17,835	\$17,835
Radio Spots - Fall	\$16,000	\$16,000	\$16,000
CapeCod.com CCBM	\$0	\$1,080	\$1,080
Radio Spots - Spring	\$19,000	\$18,000	\$18,000
Matching Grant Chamber	\$20,000	\$20,000	\$20,000
Destinations	\$2,500	\$2,410	\$2,410
CBS WBZ Geo-Farming	\$2,500	\$5,500	\$5,500
Curve ads and online	\$7,000	\$3,750	\$3,750
Hot Spots	\$11,000	\$10,155	\$13,598
EDGE	\$9,000	\$9,000	\$9,000
Gay & Lesbian Review Worldwide	\$5,000	\$6,696	\$6,696
Boston Spirit	\$6,000	\$5,400	\$5,400
Pride Publications (Dallas Voice)	\$4,000	\$1,360	\$1,360
Towleroad	\$5,000		\$15,000
Matching Coop Grant Guild	\$20,000	\$20,000	\$20,000
IGLTA - Website	\$3,000	\$3,999	\$3,999
Bird's Eye View	\$3,900	\$3,900	\$3,900
Manny Witt New England Travel	\$1,100	\$2,239	\$2,239
Outdoor - OutFront & Clear Channel		\$18,500	\$18,500
Yankee Magazine Cape Cod Travel & .com	\$3,000	\$2,950	\$3,000
Cape Cod Travel Guide		\$3,750	\$3,750
Cape Cod Times & CapeCodonline.com	\$0	\$2,500	\$2,500
New Publications (Social Media \$20K)	\$33,000	\$20,000	\$20,000
Total	\$213,000		
Travel, Conferences and Trade Shows	Budget		
American Bus Association	\$4,000		\$0
Community Marketing Partnership	\$2,000	\$2,000	\$2,000
Boston Concierge - Boston Spirit	\$1,000	\$1,000	\$1,000
Day Trips & Destinations (Hartford)	\$2,000	\$2,000	\$2,000
LGBT Expo	\$4,000		\$0
Travel & Adventure	\$9,000		\$0
Gay Days Orlando & One Magical Weekend	\$15,000		\$0
Dinah Shore Classic	\$3,000		\$0
AAA New England Show	\$3,000		\$0
New York Times or Boston Globe Travel Show		\$2,970	\$3,500
Governor's Conference	\$1,000		\$0
Discover New England	\$2,500		\$2,500
Misc Travel and Expenses	\$3,500		\$3,500
TOTAL	\$50,000		
Other Marketing Expenses	Budget		
Tote Bags		\$14,340	\$14,340
Other - Update Kiosks	\$2,000	\$2,000	\$2,000
Organization Dues	\$3,000	\$2,274	\$3,000
Sister Cities marketing efforts & Prides	\$10,000		\$0
Giant Adirondack Chair		\$3,448	\$3,448
Brochure Printing & Distribution	5,000	\$4,850	\$6,000
Photo Shoots		\$5,600	\$5,600
Graphic Design	\$15,000	\$15,000	\$14,000
PR Firm	\$40,000	\$40,000	\$40,000
Milo Interactive Web Host		\$798	\$798
TOTAL	\$75,000		
TOTAL Marketing Funds	\$338,000	\$317,304	\$343,202
Adjusted Available Marketing Funds	\$343,228		

**A. Approval of media placements, brochures and trade shows--
Tourism Director recommends media placements, brochures and
other collateral to promote and market Provincetown as a
tourism destination, or town representation in trade shows.**

➤ **Calendar Brochure Reprint:**

- We have gone through all the Tri-Fold Calendars from the first printing
- We need an additional 10,000 brochures to satisfy distribution, trade shows and in Town information centers/businesses

Move to approve \$1,250 plus shipping for brochure printing Information Center.

Discussion:

Motion: JC

Second: HS

Roll Call Vote: 7-0-0. Motion carries.

RM yea

LM yea

JC yea

MP yea

HS yea

DV yea

BS yea

➤ **Current & Pending Advertising Commitments:**

- **Gay & Lesbian Review Worldwide:** 6 Back Covers
 - May/June 2017 – Submitted
 - July/August 2017 to March/April 2018 – Pending Design

- **HotSpots:** 9 full page ads, Ptown Issue, 3 months online
 - Online – Currently running
 - Fort Lauderdale Gay Pride, Winter Party, Miami Beach Gay Pride
Ptown Issue 13 April – Submitted

 - **Pending**
 - Gay Days/One Magical Weekend
 - Fort Lauderdale Stonewall Gay Pride
 - Saint Pete Gay Pride
 - Halloween
 - White Party
 - New Year's Eve

- **Curve – Online Campaign:**
 - **Current Curve Ads**
 - April/May 105,000 Impressions – Submitted

- Promote May – October, Single Women’s Weekend to Women’s Week
 - Pending Curve Ads
 - E-Blast 300x200 plus 10 words (Space Available to TBD)
 - July/August 105,000 Impressions
 - Promote October – December, Women’s Week to New Year
 - Leaderboard 728x90
 - Small ad 300x250
 - E-Blast 300x200 plus 10 words (Space Available TBD)
- **Bird’s Eye View:**
 - 2 ads pending
 - July/August Summer Issue
 - September/October Fall Issue
- **EDGE Magazine**
 - 2 ads pending
 - May & June
- **EDGE on the Net:**
 - April ads running in rotation online
 - 2 months pending
 - May & June
- **Outdoor Billboard Campaign**
 - Clear Channel
 - Four Weeks Mid-May to Mid-June
 - 6 Digital Boards
 - Danvers Route 114
 - Peabody Route 1
 - Boston Route I93
 - Wareham Route 6/28
 - Westborough Route 9
 - Worcester Route 146/Mass Pike
 - Concept & Design needed
- **Out Film CT**
 - Full Page ad in Program
 - Concept & Design needed
- **Boston Globe Magazine**
 - Weekend Fun Guide
 - Sunday 4 June
 - Half Page Horizontal AD

- Concept and Design needed
 - Provincetown has been in doing Boston Globe Magazine and online for four consecutive years
 - Consider taking a break and using funds for new vehicle with a different audience
- **Pending Publications up for discussion with new Communications Agency and VSB**
- Towleroad \$15,000
 - American Art Collector \$2,600
 - ARTNews Magazine \$8,000
- **2017 Scheduled Press Releases**
- For discussion and review with new Communications Agency

Proposed 2017 Press releases

Subject	Date
Announcing 2017 events calendar	Feb 7
Moby Dick Marathon	Feb 21
Come home to Provincetown	Feb 28
Spring has sprung!	Mar 7
Shop hopping	Mar 21
Provincetown announces new communications partnership	Apr 4
New Accolade (TBD)	Apr 11
Entertainment & Nightlife calendar: sing and dance the night away!	Apr 18
Foodies around the world, unite!	May 2
It's not summer in the city / Boston without a trip to Provincetown	May 9
Best beaches	May 16

Arts, Culture & Heritage at Land's End	Jun 6
Safe Harbor welcomes recreational boats at new Provincetown Marina	Jun 13
Gay Athalon Games come to Provincetown	Jun 20
Eco-tourism enthusiasts, rejoice!	Jun 27
New Accolade (TBD)	Jul 11
Carnival Week 39: Gods & Goddesses, oh my!	Jul 25
New Accolade (TBD)	Aug 8
Second Summer in Provincetown	Aug 22
Halloween in Provincetown	Sep 5
First Light Provincetown Weekend & Fireworks	Sep 19
Light up your holidays in Provincetown	Oct 3
Holly Folly	Oct 17
Provincetown 400	Nov 7

B. VSB Administration

➤ Communications Agency RFP Update:

- Evaluation Committee met Friday 24 March to complete the process and make recommendations to the Chief Procurement Officer
- David Panagore, Chief Procurement Officer projects Monday 17 April to have a contract in place with the new firm
- David Panagore would like a resolution vote for the new firm, from the VSB, recommending the firm to the BoS
- BoS will meet on Thursday 13 April to vote on the new Communications Agency

DV yea
BS yea

- **Provincetown Explorer Kiosks:**
 - Software is more than ten years old and needs to be updated
 - New concept and software design is needed
 - Requesting new Communications Agency develop new concept and use of the Explorer Kiosks

- **iPtown App:**
 - Contacted vendor, Persource, who developed the iPtown app
 - Persource informed us that they no longer develop or offer support of smartphone applications, including iPtown
 - They were surprised the iPtown app is still up and running
 - They said it will eventually stop functioning and will no longer operate

- **Composition of Visitor Services Board:**
 - Discussion and re-crafting for next Town Meeting

- **Provincetown Cultural District:** Massachusetts Cultural District Initiative
 - Massachusetts has 35 cultural districts
 - The Town of Provincetown is submitted our application to become a cultural district on Monday 3 April
 - The application has been completed
 - Wellfleet Cultural District Site Visit Wednesday 26 April
 - Provincetown Cultural District Site Visit Thursday 27 April
 - 9:00 AM Town Officials Meeting
 - Raphael Richter, BoS Chair
 - Cheryl Andrews, BoS Member
 - David Gardner, Administration
 - Robert Speiser, PCC Chair
 - Gloria McPherson, Planning Office
 - Radu Luca, Tourism Office
 - Marian Peck, VSB Chair (cannot attend)
 - Lesley Marchessault, VSB Arts & Culture Representative (cannot attend)
 - Hersh Schwartz – VSB (will attend and represent the VSB)
 - Dan Vanwaus – VSB (will attend and represent the VSB)
 - 10:00 AM Walking Tour of Cultural District
 - Same attendees as above
 - 12:00 PM Stakeholders Meeting
 - Invite the Provincetown Cultural District Committee
 - Open to all interested stakeholders
 - Massachusetts Cultural Council Board Meeting

- Where: Sage Inn
- When: 12 April
- Coffee: 9:30 AM
- Meeting: 10:00 to 11:30 AM

➤ **Provincetown Tourism Partners Public Safety Meeting:**

- Invited the Town and Police Department to provide an update on safety and security for the 2017 season
- Where: Provincetown Theater
- When: Wednesday 3 May
- Time: TBD

C. Marketing and Advertising Insights

The New York Times

Use of Ad-Blocking Software Rises by 30% Worldwide

By MARK SCOTT JAN. 31, 2017

Facebook [has tried](#) to ban it. Google [has attempted](#) to outsmart it. But no matter what these tech giants do, people's use of software to block digital advertising — often the lifeblood of companies' online business models — keeps gaining traction worldwide.

In total, roughly 11 percent of internet users globally relied on ad blockers to avoid some form of digital advertising last year when surfing the web. That equates to more than 600 million devices, from smartphones to traditional computers.

The figure represents a 30 percent annual increase, according to a new report [published on Wednesday](#) by PageFair, a start-up that helps companies recoup some of this lost advertising revenue, which now [totals tens of billions of dollars](#) each year.

By using software to block digital advertising, critics say, users are breaking an unwritten pact with websites and digital publishers, many of which generate the bulk of their revenue from these ads.

Yet industry watchers say such ad-blocking digital tools have garnered a mainstream following, particularly across the developing world where their use in countries like Indonesia has already reached roughly two-thirds of the internet population.

“There’s been a massive surge of mobile ad-blockers in these countries that no one anticipated,” said Sean Blanchfield, chief executive of PageFair. “In the West, I expect the same trend to blindside us in the very near future.”

This rise of ad blockers has not gone unnoticed by the advertising industry.

In August, for instance, Facebook — one of the world’s largest purveyors of online ads — [tried to block](#) people from using such software on its social network.

The company’s efforts, though, led to an arms race with [tech start-ups offering new ad-blocking tools](#), as both sides have tried to outmatch each other.

“Ad blocking is a detriment to the entire advertising ecosystem,” Paul Verna, an analyst at the research firm eMarketer, said in a statement. “The best way for the industry to tackle this problem is to deliver compelling ad experiences that consumers won’t want to block.”

Across the developing world, ad-blocking software is primarily used by people to save on often costly data packages by removing video and other data-hungry advertisements from mobile websites.

More than 90 percent of all ad-blocking on mobile devices worldwide still takes place in the Asia-Pacific region, according to the PageFair report. And last year, such software was used on 380 million smartphones and tablets around the globe, a 39 percent yearly increase.

In contrast, the vast majority of ad-blocking on traditional computers, whose use similarly jumped 17 percent last year, to 236 million devices, is still restricted mainly to the United States and Europe. In those regions, people’s efforts to block malware disguised as online advertising has been the main motivation for downloading ad blockers.

“In the U.S., ad-blocking on mobile is slightly immature,” Mr. Blanchfield said. “But there’s no doubt that people’s use of it will skyrocket.”

3. Board members statements.

HS – none

MP – none

