

Finance Committee Meeting  
 February 20, 2008  
 10:00am  
 Judge Welsh Meeting Room  
 Called to Order: 10:00 am

**Membership:**

<b>P</b>	<b>E</b>	<b>U</b>	<b>Name</b>	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Gary Delius, Chair	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Ruth Gilbert, Vice Chair	
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Robert Vetrick	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Virginia Ross (arrived 10:10)	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Thomas Thurston (a.m. only)	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Walt Winnowski	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Edward Gage	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Thomas Coen	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	David Bedard	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Philip Gaudiano, Alternate	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Voting (p.m. only)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Frederic Biddle, Alternate	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Voting (arrived 10:05)

**(Note: P = Present E = Excused U = Unexcused)**

**Also Present:**

Sharon Lynn, Town Manager  
 Alix Heilala, Finance Director

**Order of Business:**

1. To review the Budgets for Division III, Public Safety
2. To review the Budget for Division IV, Public Works.
3. To review other Division budgets as time permits.
4. To consider minutes of previous meetings.
5. To consider other business which may legally come before the Finance Committee.

**New Committee Member Introduced**

The Committee Chair introduced new member Philip Gaudiano who replaces Alice Foley as an alternate. The Committee welcomed Mr. Gaudiano to its ranks.

**Budget Reviews**

**294 Harbor Committee** - Presented by Gerard Irmer

The Finance Committee asked Mr. Irmer if he would agree to reduce the Contracted Services budget by having a member of the Harbor Committee take meeting minutes for some of the less critical meetings. Mr. Irmer agreed to the reduction.

**Motion #1** : To amend budget 294, Harbor Committee follows:

- Reduce the B Budget (Expenses) by \$250 from the 52102 Contracted Services line;

And to recommend the revised total amount of \$1,295.

Motion By: Thomas Thurston		Second By: Walter Winnowski	
For: 8	Against: 0	Abstain: 0	Recuse: PG

**210 Police Department** - Presented by Warren Tobias & Andrea Poulin

There was a lengthy discussion with the Acting Police Chief and the Town Manager about staffing levels, salaries, summer police, and the need for such a high overtime budget. Key points of the discussion were:

- Based on the 4 on 2 off staffing model, a total of 18 officers are required to cover 3 shifts 365 days a year.
- Staffing is supplemented using “summer” police.
- Intermittent officers are also used “on-call” but are difficult to find.
- The department has been chronically short-staffed and is having difficulty recruiting and retaining qualified officers.
- Provincetown officers are regarded as highly qualified by other police departments and law enforcement agencies resulting in high turnover.

- Truro, in particular, has a higher pay scale than Provincetown and a less stressful working environment.
- The proposed police union contract will bring Provincetown salaries into parity with Truro by 2010.
- The third year of the proposed 5% salary increase is included in the budget.
- Coverage for the July 4<sup>th</sup> fireworks celebration is not included in this budget.
- There are currently 2 officers out on short-term disability and 2 vacancies.
- 4 new officers are just completing their training at the Police Academy and will be deployed before the summer.
- Officers are being forced to work double shifts in order to maintain coverage due to vacancies, vacations and injuries. This is not a safe practice long term.
- On average, the department responds to 38 calls per day.

Members of the Committee challenged the need for so much overtime in the budget, especially with the 4 new hires coming on board, and asked how much we have used year-to-date. According to Ms. Heilala, 91% of this years overtime budget has already been spent.

The Committee also asked that the housing allowance for the Police Chief be removed from the budget. Mr. Tobias and Ms. Lynn agreed.

**Motion #2** : To amend budget 210, Police Department, as follows:

- Reduce the A Budget (Personal Services) by \$20,000 from the 51105 Overtime line; and by \$9,000 from the 51191 Other salaried benefits line;

And to recommend the revised total amount of \$2,025,789.

Motion By: Thomas Thurston		Second By: Virginia Ross	
For:	Against:	Abstain:	Recuse:

Discussion shifted to line item 52107, Investigations (Special Agent). This is a new item in the amount of \$5,000. Mr. Tobias explained that funding for

undercover narcotics investigations from the State has dried up and that this is needed to support the department's detective. Some members of the Committee disagreed.

A motion was made to amend Motion #2 as follows:

<b>Motion #3</b> : To amend budget 210, Police Department, as follows:			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Reduce the A Budget (Personal Services) by \$20,000 from the 51105 Overtime line; and by \$9,000 from the 51191 Other salaried benefits line;</li> <li>• And to reduce the B Budget (Expenses) budget by \$5,000 from the 52107 Investigations (Special Agent) line;</li> </ul>			
And to recommend the revised total amount of \$2,020,789.			
Motion By: Frederic Biddle		Second By: David Bedard	
For: 4	Against: 5	Abstain: 0	Recuse:

**Motion #3 did not pass.** A motion was made to re-introduce Motion #2.

<b>Motion #4</b> : To amend budget 210, Police Department, as follows:			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Reduce the A Budget (Personal Services) by \$20,000 from the 51105 Overtime line; and by \$9,000 from the 51191 Other salaried benefits line;</li> </ul>			
And to recommend the revised total amount of \$2,025,789.			
Motion By: Ruth Gilbert		Second By: Frederic Biddle	
For: 4	Against: 5	Abstain: 0	Recuse:

**Motion #4 did not pass.** A new motion was made.

<b>Motion #5</b> : To amend budget 210, Police Department, as follows:			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Reduce the A Budget (Personal Services) by \$9,000 from the 51191 Other salaried benefits line;</li> </ul>			
And to recommend the revised total amount of \$2,045,789.			
Motion By: Thomas Thurston		Second By: Virginia Ross	
For: 7	Against: 2	Abstain: 0	Recuse:

Mr. Tobias was asked if there are any opportunities for the department to share services with other towns on the Cape. He pointed out that there are already joint operations with the Cape Cod Regional Law Enforcement Council on criminal investigations, accident reconstruction and SWAT team operations. It may be possible to regionalize other operations such as dispatch services but this should be approached slowly.

A short conversation followed on the subject of fines to animal owners who violate Town regulations. It is the sense of the Committee that the fines are set too low to be a deterrent and that enforcement is uneven.

**211 Police Station** - Presented by Warren Tobias & Andrea Poulin

Mr. Bedard inquired whether an energy audit has been performed on the Police Station? (Energy and heat costs account for most of this budget). Mr. Tobias believes that it was done by DPW.

<b>Motion #6</b> : To recommend budget 211, Police Station, in the amount of \$42,800.			
Motion By: Thomas Thurston		Second By: Edward Gage	
For: 9	Against: 0	Abstain: 0	Recuse:

*The meeting was in recess from 12:00pm to 1:03pm. Mr. Thurston was excused from the afternoon portion of the meeting. Mr. Gaudiano became a voting member.*

**231 Ambulance Service** - Presented by Steven Roderick, James Meads & John Thomas

The Town’s assessment for Lower Cape Ambulance services is budgeted to rise by \$129,757 (32%) over FY08.

Mr. Roderick and the other presenters explained the increase as follows:

- A 4<sup>th</sup> crew has been added. The number of full employees has risen from 15 to 20.

- To improve safety and working conditions, crews are now on call for 48 hours, then off for 96 hours.
- Health insurance was shifted to Harvard Pilgrim which saved \$1,800 per month.
- Recruitment has been issue due to relatively low pay rates. New hourly rates for EMTs are now competitive. There will be no raises until 2010.
- Union salaries for a full-time department would be significantly higher based on Wellfleet's experience.

On the revenue/reimbursements side:

- Insurance company reimbursements vary from 40% for Commonwealth Care, to 50% for Medicare, to 100% for Harvard Pilgrim. The Town is responsible for the difference.
- A growing number of patients are on the State's Commonwealth Care plan. Also, due to our aging population, a growing number are on Medicare.
- Many foreign workers do not have any coverage for ambulance transportation. The Town is then responsible for the full cost.
- Efforts to obtain re-imburement from uninsured or underinsured patients have been stepped up but it is often difficult to collect.
- Any surplus funds are applied to debt service.

Ms. Gilbert asked if any of the Board members are paid. Yes, two – the CEO (\$6,500) and the Treasurer (\$14,500). Ms. Gilbert also commented that ambulance services are the only service that's been regionalized.

As we did last year, the Committee discussed what action can be taken to ensure that foreign workers have insurance that covers ambulance services. Can businesses that sponsor foreign workers be held liable? Unfortunately, the EMTs cannot ask who the employer is unless the employee was injured on the job and it becomes a Worker Compensation case. The best strategy seems to be to work the Chamber of Commerce and the Provincetown Business Guild to educate them on the need for them to make sure that foreign workers have an insurance policy that covers ambulance services.

**Motion #7** : To recommend budget 231, Ambulance Service, in the amount of \$535,057.

Motion By: Ruth Gilbert				Second By: Virginia Ross			
For: 9		Against: 0		Abstain: 0		Recuse:	

**295 Harbormaster** - Presented by Rex McKinsley

FY09 is the 4<sup>th</sup> year of a 5 year contract between the Town and the Provincetown Public Pier Corporation to provide Harbormaster and marine management services. The amount of the FY09 budget is set in the contract.

There was a discussion about the operating revenues that are returned to the Town. The FY07 actuals were as follows:

Wharf Mooring fees	\$80,000	Into Municipal Waterways Fund
Boat Excise tax	\$6,000	½ into the General Fund; ½ into the Municipal Waterways Fund
Pier Corp Rent/Lease Payment	\$92,000	Into General Fund
Pier Corp Insurance Co-Pay	\$17,687	Into the General Fund
<b>Total Operating Revenues</b>	<b>\$195,687</b>	

**Motion #8** : To recommend budget 295, Harbor Master, in the amount of \$140,000.

Motion By: David Bedard		Second By: Thomas Coen	
For: 9	Against: 0	Abstain: 0	Recuse:

**296 Shellfish** – Presented by Anthony Jackett

Mr. Jackett pointed out that we had a very good bay scallop season. One of the duties of the Shellfish Warden is to seed the shellfish beds. The budget includes \$3,500 for shellfish stock and the State provides a matching grant.

There was a brief discussion about license revenue. Mr. Jackett stated that license fees provide a small amount of revenue that goes into the Shellfish Revolving Fund. Current rates are \$15 for a resident; \$50 for a non-resident and free for seniors. The Committee suggested that perhaps license fees need to be revisited.

Mr. Jackett also mentioned that shell fishermen have requested that a weekly parking permit be made available for the West End parking lot so that they don't have to feed the meters and risk getting a ticket. The Parking Department is considering this idea.

<b>Motion #9</b> : To recommend budget 296, Shellfish, in the amount of \$49,595.			
Motion By: Ruth Gilbert		Second By: Edward Gage	
For: 9	Against: 0	Abstain: 0	Recuse:

**299 Parking** – Presented by Pat Benatti & Deb Gonsalves

Ms. Ross asked why there is \$500 in the budget for maintenance of the software that controls the variable message signs when they don't work. It was agreed that this would be removed from the budget.

Mr. Delius asked about the status of the handheld Digital Ticketing System. Ms. Benatti explained that it takes 5-6 minutes to issue a ticket which is too long so it's not being used. Mr. Delius suggested that they get in touch with the MIS Director, Mr. Jackett, to resolve the problem.

Ms. Gilbert challenged the overtime budget of \$1,500. Ms. Heilala reported that the actual year-to-date has been \$1,477 for meter personnel.

The Committee also objected to spending \$3,011.05 dollars to repair and take dents out of parking department cars; and to a \$6,500 telephone budget when FY07's actual was only \$3,043.

<b>Motion #10</b> : To amend budget 299, Parking, as follows:	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>To reduce the B budget (Expenses) by \$500 from the 54202 Computer Maint/Software line; by \$2,500 from the 52400 Telephone line; and \$3,000 from the 52406 Additional Equipment Purchase line;</li> </ul>	
And to recommend the revised total amount of \$390,973.	
Motion By: Virginia Ross	Second By: Walter Winnowski

For: 9	Against: 0	Abstain: 0	Recuse:
--------	------------	------------	---------

### **113 Elections & Town Meetings** – Presented by Douglas Johnstone

Mr. Johnstone pointed out that we have three elections scheduled next year as opposed to two this year. This accounts for the increase in the budget.

<b>Motion # 11:</b> To recommend budget 113, Elections & Town Meetings, in the amount of \$12,544.
--

Motion By: Virginia Ross	Second By: Walter Winnowski		
For: 9	Against: 0	Abstain: 0	Recuse:

### **161 Town Clerk** – Presented by Douglas Johnstone

Mr. Johnstone proposed self-publishing the annual Town Report rather than having it done by a professional printer. A limited number of copies would be made using a copy machine for distribution at Town Meeting. The content of the report could also be trimmed. After discussing the merits of this proposal, the sense of the Committee is that the potential savings (\$4,200) are not sufficient to warrant a change at this time but the idea should be re-considered in the future.

<b>Motion #12 :</b> To recommend budget 161, Town Clerk, in the amount of \$99,872.
---

Motion By: Edward Gage	Second By: Thomas Coen		
For: 9	Against: 0	Abstain: 0	Recuse:

### **123 Town Manager** – Presented by Sharon Lynn

*(Mr. Delius recused himself; Ms. Gilbert chaired the discussion).*

Ms. Lynn explained the main reason for the increase in the FY09 budget. The Assistant Town Manager position, which was approved by the prior Board of

Selectmen, was only funded for part of the current year at \$48,750. Next year it will be funded for the entire year at \$63,059.

<b>Motion #13</b> : To recommend budget 123, Town Manager, in the amount of \$251,312.			
Motion By: Thomas Coen		Second By: Edward Gage	
For: 8	Against: 0	Abstain: 0	Recuse: GD

**151 Legal Services** – Presented by Sharon Lynn

Ms. Lynn explained that the Legal Services budget is driven by the amount of litigation the Town is involved with, projects requiring legal assistance such as 90 Shankpainter Road, and labor issues. Year to date, we have spent \$134K of the \$175K budget. She is also trying to reduce the amount of contact with Town Counsel regarding routine issues.

The possibility of hiring an in-house counsel to reduce outside legal expenses was raised. Ms. Lynn pointed out that finding a person with the breadth of legal expertise to address all of the issues the Town faces would be difficult. However, the possibility should be considered in future.

<b>Motion #14</b> : To recommend budget 151, Legal Services, in the amount of \$200,000			
Motion By: Virginia Ross		Second By: Edward Gage	
For: 9	Against: 0	Abstain: 0	Recuse:

Next Meeting:	February 25, 2005 @ 1:00pm
Adjourn:	4:04pm
Minutes by:	Thomas Coen

Approved by \_\_\_\_\_ on \_\_\_\_\_, 2008  
Gary Delius, Chair