



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Judge Welsh Hearing Room

June 20, 2012

3:30 p.m.

Members Present: Polly Burnell (arr 4:15p), John Dowd, Ryan Landry, Marcene Marcoux, and David McGlothlin.

Member Absent: none

Alternate Present: Thom Biggert

Staff: Maxine Notaro

Work Session was called to order at 3:31 p.m.

663 Commercial Street – The owner initially came in for siding and roofing. Many discoveries were made during renovation. The roof collapsed. It was sort of a lean-to type of garage which had 3 walls with the fourth being one side of the house. He'd like to remove the rest of the frame and reframe. He was basically asking for a partial demolition but John Dowd had to see a picture of the property.

The owner went home and hurriedly returned with a picture taken and brought in on an I-pad. The project was approved.

18 Commercial St – The owner wants to rebuild a chimney from the roofline up and replace in kind.

This was approved by the HDC.

47 Commercial Street – The owners want to install a fence which will be 6 ft at back and then graduate down to 4 ft. Purpose: wants to hide neighbor's fence. The height was approved as requested but the overwrought embellishments at the top of the fence were deemed inappropriate and not approved.

Decision: Same height is approved but without the extra embellishments – as in no lattice on top.

4 Franklin Street – The owner would like to replace 6 windows with simulated divided lights with interior and exterior applied muntins. They have already replaced some of the windows like this. John Dowd said that they are nice old windows and they could be restored – But. The project was approved.

3 Point Street - 2 bay windows and 6 on the top floor. The project was approved.

Public Statements

There were none.

14 Winslow Street

Justin Post will be restructuring the application since the original was lost.

Motion: Move to approve the windows as originally presented.

Motion: Moved, seconded, and approved by all.

Minutes for June 6th meeting.

Motion: Move to approve the minutes of June 6th as amended.

Motion: John Dowd Seconded: Marcene Marcoux

Vote: 4-0-1 ab (DM)

150 Commercial Street. Amy Germain will come in on July 18th and the application has to be re-filed. Amy is amenable to this decision.

Public Hearing 4:00 p.m.

Case# FY12-44

Application by Topknot Properties LLC for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to modify the design submitted in case file # FY12-20 and approved November 21, 2011 for the property at **225 Commercial St.**

(The people sitting on the case are: Thom Biggert, John Dowd, Ryan Landry, Marcene Marcoux, and David McGlothlin.)

The person from Topknot Properties was asked to summarize the changes – and to do it elevation by elevation. That request was the introduction to a marathon discussion. The north side contained the commercial part of the application. Marcene Marcoux commented that we're missing one half of the application, i.e.,

what was approved and what is now being proposed. The owner wants to have more windows on the 2nd floor.

John Dowd said that the owner needs to verbalize his changes. On the south elevation we'd like to open it up for business and would like - on the rear of the building - more glass. We originally thought we'd keep the back yard and the beach private but now want that changed. He doesn't know the logic of the design but they do want larger windows.

Polly Burnell entered the meeting at this point - about 15 minutes after the discussion had begun.

On the west elevation – the biggest change is the style of the windows to match what will be on the 2nd & 3rd floors and a little bump-out. He wants to hide the bank parking lot. He'd like to take away the big window that they had in back.

The meeting was then opened up to the public – no comments.

Thom felt that the west elevation is good but the last plan was far more pleasing.

Marcene said - you have the plans and all the decisions that went into it. Now we have less of the information but you're really making a great many changes.

The owner defended himself briefly.

Polly said that windows have a great impact on the building and read the guideline again regarding the windows. She said that the way the new application is – there is no historic precedence for the new plan.

The owner jumped in again and said - but the 1st floor is made for business.

Regarding the north elevation, David McGlothlin said that he prefers the original plan and what was approved. He has a problem with the windows on the 2nd level and it takes away from what the traditional storefronts historically looked like. This new proposal seems as though its going to be all glass. David thinks that it doesn't look correct.

The HDC prefers the original plan and the owner wants a modern glass edifice.

Eventually, after quite a bit more discussion, the following motion was made:

Motion: Move to continue until the July 18th meeting and waive the time constraints.

Motion: John Dowd

Seconded: Marcene Marcoux

Vote: 5-0-0.

Case# FY12-45

Application by Robert Valois for Howard Burchman for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to add a new floor with 4' knee-walls and dormers as well as a 3' x 7' bump-out addition to the Cottage at the property at **12 Center St.**

(David McGlothlin stepped down from hearing the case.)

(Sitting on the case were Thom Biggert, Polly Burnell, John Dowd, Ryan Landry, and Marcene Marcoux.)

Howard Burchman said that he wanted to come back about the cottage. He has a large lot which is over 105 ft deep. The out building is the smallest structure in the neighborhood. Howard had space problems which he detailed as follows: if he put a queen bed in there, there is no room to move around. He doesn't think the flat roof garage conversion adds anything to it.

Robert Valois talked about the new plan. He preferred to withdraw and come back with another plan. He feels the original plan was better and related to the main house much better. He's made some windows smaller and the other three elevations are mostly the same. So, he said that he's come up with a more streamlined plan that relates to the main building.

Polly Burnell said that she thought that the building was too big. She continued that she understands the need – it looks as though it's going to be taller than the main house. It's going from 10'9" to 21'.

John Dowd said that it's an awkward shape. He'd like it wider and lower.

Marcene Marcoux said that you still need to simplify this. Everything about it could be beautiful.

Howard said that he needs the cottage to be larger.

Polly asked - why do you want to add a level - and round and round they went. She doesn't want a stairway and Howard wants a 2nd floor. Howard also said that he was having a bad hair day because of all the humidity!?

Marcene said that she would approve it since they did simplify it as originally requested. Howard doesn't want a circular stairway. Ryan likes the quirks of Provincetown. It's got its own charm and style. It's absolutely unique. He likes the style.

John Dowd that we've let every single floor building become 1½ story structures; its pastiche. The Brass Key has created a look that we never had. It's what people like. It's a faux history and something that was never here. He'd like it lowered by 2 feet.

Marcene said that it makes more sense for Robert to come back with some options. **Motion: Move that the size of the building be reduced to 19'6" and that the 2nd story alcove containing the circular stairway have a top crown molding consistent with top molding; the doors be changed from a 9 lgt to a single light 3 or 4 panel Provincetown door. Also, the detailing on that bay window have a recessed panel under the bay and the recessed panel will be duplicated on the addition.**

Motion: John Dowd Seconded: Ryan Landry 4 in favor-1 opp (PB)

A revised plan will be submitted for the file taking into consideration all of the above mentioned changes. Guidelines 6B and 15 were cited as the reasons for the rulings.

149 Commercial Street – Everyone signed the denial of the continuation which happened at the last meeting. It was a basic housekeeping issue.

Reorganization of Historic District Commission

Motions were made, seconded, and approved for the following positions:

Chair	John Dowd
Vice Chair	David McGlothlin
Clerk	Polly Burnell

Adjournment happened at 6 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Evelyn Gaudiano

E. Rogers Gaudiano

Approved by _____ **on** _____, 2012.
John Dowd, Chair