



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Judge Welsh Hearing Room

May 2, 2012

3:30 p.m.

Members Present: Polly Burnell, John Dowd, Ryan Landry, Marcene Marcoux, and David McGlothlin.

Member Absent: none

Alternate Absent: Lynne Corbett and Benji Fox

Staff: Maxine Notaro

Work Session 3:30 p.m.

●Public Statements

Eric Dray from the Historical Commission requested the Historical District Commission's help in purchasing maps for use of all the committees. After a brief description of the maps, the following motion was made:

Motion: Move to have the Historic District Commission give the Historical Commission \$750 from their educational fund for the purchase of the maps just mentioned above.

Motion: John Dowd Seconded: Ryan Landry Vote: 5-0-0.

●Administrative Reviews

50B Commercial St – replace existing side porch with sunroom with no change to footprint. Approved.

250 Commercial St – Install clapboard on Big Vin's Liquors. Approved.

4 Atkins Lane – Remove octagonal windows at both front & rear peaks & replace with series 400 awning window with divided lights – Finish with ¼ trim painted white. Approved.

6 Winthrop Street – Replace picket fence 3’ high x 26’6” long. Wood with same dimensions. Approved.

274 Bradford Street – Install 2 skylights back of building which are not visible from the street. Approved.

4 Cemetery Road – Remove old windows and replace with new. Remove & replace cedar siding. Approved.

619 Commercial St – Install 20 new windows in kind. Install new sidewall shingles on water side of house and new roof shingles on entire roof. Approved.

71 Commercial St – Mark Kinane just dropped by to ask for permission to flip the knees to the inside so they’ll be less obvious (FEMA regs). Approved.

150 Commercial St – Amy Germain wants to put a low profile 5 X 22 ft array of solar panels on the front roof of her home. Marcene Marcoux felt that the project should have a full review and the rest of the HDC agreed. They need a drawing of the roof and the placement of the panels. Amy will return with the necessary paper work.

●**Review and approve previous minutes**

Motion: Move to approve the minutes of the April 18th meeting as amended.

Motion: John Dowd Seconded: Polly Burnell Vote: 4-0-1 ab (RL)

The Public Hearing portion of the meeting was opened at 4:00 p.m.

Open Meeting Law Complaint from Bernard Brahm concerning the Commission’s March 21, 2012 meeting

-Acknowledge receipt of complaint, consider possible responses thereto, and vote to resolve the same

-An executive session may be held in accordance with G.L. c.30A, §§21(a)(1) and (a)(3) to consider the complaint against public officers and to discuss strategy with respect to such complaint and response thereto

John Dowd, the Chair of the HDC, said, “The Commission has an Open Meeting Law Complaint from Bernard Brahm concerning the Commission’s March 21, 2012 meeting.”

John continued, "Today's agenda item is to acknowledge receipt of complaint, consider possible responses thereto, and vote to resolve the same"

Motion: Move where the Commission properly posted its March 21, 2012 meeting, and included thereon detailed items concerning the Open meeting Law complaints would discuss at that meeting, including the potential that it would enter executive session, and where the Commission chose not to enter executive session to discuss such particular matters, and where the commission discussed in open session the matters indicated, including the merits and risks of its proposed response to such complaints, the commission hereby determines that no additional action need be taken in response to the complaint filed by Mr. Brahm, and further authorized Town Counsel to send a response to the Attorney General consistent with this vote.

There was a discussion on the motion and the vote followed:

Motion: Marcene Marcoux Seconded: Polly Burnell Vote: 5-0-0

Pending Cases

Case# FY12-35 (Request continuance to June 6, 2012)

Application by Mark Kinnane of Cape Associates, Inc. on behalf of Johnny Pak for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to demolish the existing structure and rebuild a new structure at the property located at **149 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

(Polly Burnell, John Dowd, Benji Fox, Ryan Landry, and David McGlothlin sat on this case.)

Motion: Move to grant the continuance for FY12-35 until the June 6, 2012 meeting – eliminating the time constraints.

Motion: John Dowd Seconded: Polly Burnell Vote: 3-0-2 ab (RL & MM)

Case# FY12-36 (Continued from April 18, 2012)

Application by Steven H. Cook of Cotuit Bay Design, LLC on behalf of KIP Financial LLC for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval for the following changes: East Elevation: construct a second floor dormer; South Elevation: demolition of the smaller section and construct a new 20' x 28' addition; East

Elevation: remove the porch and construct a new single story addition and; remove the existing shed at the property located at **10 Prince Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Marcene Marcoux stepped down from the case.

David Nicolau, a real estate broker, handed out pictures to everyone and then the attorney, Lester J. Murphy, Jr. presented the case. He dwelled on fairness and questioned why other neighbors were allowed to put on additions and yet his client couldn't. He even mentioned that the streetscape had truly changed because the Catholic church had been rebuilt and was not in the same location that it had occupied. The discussion ran on and on with the following decision being made.

Polly Burnell cited the guidelines referring to the decision as being: 5b, 5e, & 5f for windows.....doors-6b.....dormers 8a.....& additions 15.

Motion: Move to accept the proposal with the following alterations. The east elevation dormer will reduce the # of windows from 4 to 2, that both doors revert to windows and that 2 doors are in a recessed alcove and the chimney will be retained.

Motion: John Dowd Seconded: David McGlothlin Vote: 3-0-1 ab (RL)

New Case

Case# FY12-39

Application by Steven Cook of Cotuit Bay Design on behalf of Juliet Gluck for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to demolish an existing one story 12' x 24' cottage with an attached deck which is an historically insignificant style, and construct a new one and a half story cottage with a new deck in the existing footprint at the property located at **401½ Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Steven Cook said that his project is located directly behind Devon's Restaurant. There were no public comments from anyone.

Polly B. said that if it were an old fish shack she couldn't vote for the demo but it was just an historically insignificant shed type building. Marcene M. agreed with Polly and said that it was a building more for the storage of food.

John Dowd guided Steven Cook on his plan for the cottage. John said that increasingly there is a little too much detail for the simplicity that is inherent in a

beach cottage. He would like a simple flat casing for the windows which should be 2 over 1. Also just a plain Provincetown door while eliminating all the grills on the water side. The projecting balcony is supported all the way with brackets and the hood over the side door should be plain and should almost read as flat. The entire design should be simplified and scaled back.

Steven Cook will take all the suggestions under advisement and return with a plan that reflects them.

Adjournment happened at 5:40 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Evelyn Gaudiano

E. Rogers Gaudiano

Approved by _____ on _____, 2012.
John Dowd, Chair