



# HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

**September 7, 2011**

**Judge Welsh Hearing Room**

**3:30 p.m.**

- Members Present:** Polly Burnell(left @6:40p), Lynne Corbett, Marcene Marcoux, David McGlothlin, and Carol Neal.
- Member Absent:** John Dowd (excused)
- Alternates:** Stephen Borkowski (unexcused)
- Staff:** Russell Braun (left at 5:30p) and Maxine Notaro

The meeting was called to order at 3:40 p.m.

## **Work Session 3:40 p.m.**

### **●Public Statements**

There were none.

### **●Administrative Reviews**

**31 Court Street** – Kay presented – The owners want to box out the building and make it look like the house below. Carol said that she needs to see a picture of the whole house. Kay brought in a picture of the entire house a bit later and it was approved.

**47 Commercial Street** – There's a French door and the owners just want to replace it with a slider. This, too, was approved. David said that in the future he would like a full picture – not just a side view.

**523 Commercial Street** –Ginny Binder presented the case. The fence in this condominium project was constructed and a violation notice went up. Ginny wants the HDC to say that it was O.K. that we put it up and remove the violation notice. She agrees that there aren't enough gaps to allow views to the public but – she didn't plan it.

There were many letters from abutters - all read into the record – all in approval of the fence.

Carol said that it is solid and oversized. Ginny said that she's the only one who lives in this complex year round....so she asked - can this issue wait until next year?

The discussion went on with the final conclusion being: The HDC will write a letter to the condo association stating that there is a violation and it must be corrected in two months and Carol said that the letter will include a policy and reason for the action.

**120 Bradford Street** – The owners want to replace every window in the house. They live in a very drafty house and wish to get energy efficient windows. They also decided to add replacing all the siding and trim as well. Carol said that this will call for a full review. The owner said he doesn't see why because he will be replacing in kind.

Maxine's understanding is that everything will be replaced in kind. The owners want to use hardee board which will require a full hearing.

**Motion: Move to approve the replacement of the windows with Anderson 400 series with 2 over 1.**

**The motion was made, seconded, and approved by all.**

A full hearing on the rest of the work will be held on October 19<sup>th</sup>.

- **Review and approve previous minutes**

- **Any other business that shall properly come before the board**

*Public Hearing 4:25 p.m.*

**Case# FY12-03**

**Application by Deborah Paine, Inc. on behalf of Robert Speiser and Anthony Brackett** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to make changes to the Main House as follows: Front Elevation: remove door and replace with a window, Left Elevation: construct second floor roof deck with balusters to match existing and remove window and replace with a door, Right Elevation: remove one existing window and; Rear Elevation: replace door with a window at the property located at **8 Cottage Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Carol Neal is an abutter and she stepped down. Since there were so few members hearing the case, Deb would like to poll the board before the final vote. Her clients bought the house about a year ago and they would like to redo some of the property.

Ms. Paine went page by page explaining the plans to the HDC. The following motion was made:

**Motion: Move to accept the plan as presented with the small window on the right elevation becoming a regular window.**

**Motion: Polly Burnell                      Seconded: Marcene Marcoux                      Vote: 4-0-0**

**Case# FY12-04**

**Application by Deborah Paine, Inc.** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to remove a roof top deck and create a shed roof dormer with two double-hung windows at the property located at **91 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.** Deborah said that we have this box-like thing on the top deck and right now the whole roof has failed. There were discussions with the owner for removing it and we felt – just remove the whole thing and put a shed dormer on the front and on the water side. Just move the roof forward a couple of feet and put a small pergola on it. Deb felt it was a simple concept. One letter from an abutter was read which requested that the project be approved since it will greatly improve the property.

**Motion: Move to approve 91 Commercial Street as presented.**

**Motion: Polly Burnell                      Seconded: Carol Neal                      Vote: 5-0-0**

**Case# FY12-05**

**Application by Robin Reid, Esq. d/b/o Marcus Builders** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to rebuild structure and increase the livable square footage in accordance with attached plans at the property located at **170 Bradford Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Victor Depaulo is the new owner and the house is located at the corner of Brewster & Bradford. He wants to demolish the structure and rebuild as per the plans submitted. Marcene Marcoux said she just wants to bring the demolition thing to closure.

**Motion: Move to approve the demolition of 170 Bradford Street as agreed to in former minutes.**

**Motion was made, seconded, and approved by all.**

Carol asked if everyone had an opportunity to look at the drawings. Marcene said that she wants what can be saved to be saved.

Rob Tosner spoke in support of the project and knew the contractor who, according to Rob, has a great track record. His support, along with many abutters' letters were read in full support of the project.

Robin Reid, the attorney representing the owner, asked for opinions from the HDC and she received them. A proposed porch was nixed and the shutters that had already been purchased met with underwhelming semi-approval.

Polly, along with the rest of the HDC, said that she was under the impression that the group wanted the main portion of the house exactly replicated.

Russell Braun, the Building Commission, said that he asked them to include some things that weren't included in the original submission. In terms of window trim – there aren't any records of what it may have looked at 50 yrs ago.

David McGlothlin said that we like to see federal style homes replicated and that needs to have more research done. We feel that it's so historically important a house and to take it a step further – we would like to see is an honest complete effort. We don't want to see a minimum effort – but a maximum effort.

Robin asked - so you'd like us to do more homework?

Polly said - basically we wanted to see a reproduction.

Robin stated that very little will be visible from the street.  
Finally the following motion was made:

**Motion: Move to approve with the following conditions – east west retain original dimensions of the house with the exception of the door – eliminate porches – applicant has the option of having wooden shutters if he so desires – windows should be 2 over 1 – chimney must be replicated.**

**Motion: Polly Burnell                      Seconded: Marcene Marcoux                      Vote: 5-0-0**

### **Case# FY12-06**

**Application by Robert Valois on behalf of Enco Realty Trust** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval for the demolition and reconstruction of an existing structure within the same footprint; raise the ridge 9' 0"; add dormers and replace windows and doors and add a new front porch at the property located at **32 Bradford Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Robert Valois, the architect, reviewed the former applications and plans for this property that had been approved in the past and then never acted upon.

Lenny Enos, the owner, said that the building has now been condemned by the Building Commissioner and he requested approval for demolition. He then gave a history of both the owners and the uses of the building. It was first used for storage, added to for housing for relatives of the then owner, and finally became a dormitory type facility for employees. Lenny continued by saying that he'd like to get started on this project as soon as possible.

Some members of the HDC cited the historic value of the property and Lenny countered by saying – some buildings have no real historic value and just happened to get added to as the need arose. He mentioned “Mary Spaghetti’s” property. He said it was the 1<sup>st</sup> after hours spot in town and was just a shack that received permission for demolition. He compared his property to Mary Spaghetti’s which was at 2 Bradford Street.

**Motion: Move to accept the demolition of the 32 Bradford Street property.**

**Motion: Carol Neal      Seconded: Marcene Marcoux      Vote: 5-0-0**

The design for the garage replacement was a much discussed topic. Robert V. said that they would like to keep it as simple as possible.

**Motion: Move to continue the application for building at the 32 Bradford Street location until the next available meeting.**

**Motion was made and seconded by all in attendance.**

(Polly Burnell left at this point.)

#### **Case# FY12-07**

**Application by Cape Tip Construction on behalf of Francine D'Olimpio** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to construct a dormer on the west side of the building to accommodate legal egress stairs to the first floor and to replace siding at the property located at **366 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Kay presented the plan and said that part of this plan has been approved. They've tried many different ways to get a legal set of stairs and this is the best option that Kay figured out. Looking at the south elevation – there are currently two dog house dormers and she would begin the shed dormer at that point.

**Motion: Move to accept elevation (page 5) as presented citing the 8A guideline.**

**Motion: Carol Neal                      Seconded: Lynne Corbett      Vote: 4-0-0**

**Administrative Reviews (cont.)**

**650 Commercial Street** – This was approved.

**536 Commercial Street** – replace windows – approved.

**178 Bradford Street** – replace windows – o.k. – HDC needs catalog cuts

**275 Commercial Street** – submitted photos & catalog cuts – changing windows to glass & wood? Maxine will call and ask for more information.

**555 Commercial Street** – remove chimney to roofline and rebuild it. – will use old brick This was approved. Also they want to redo railing system on the deck. Photograph didn't get printed out.

At this point the HDC began a discussion on the merits of hardee board. Negatives are that it fades – we've seen that it dents and paint is flaking off on a building near Town Hall – and most important- there are reports that it's a carcinogenic.

**Adjournment happened at 7:20 p.m.**

Respectfully submitted,

*Evelyn Gaudiano*

E. Rogers Gaudiano

**Approved by** \_\_\_\_\_ on \_\_\_\_\_, 2011.  
Carol Neal, Vice Chairman