

Historic District Commission
Meeting of
August 4, 2004, 4:00 PM
Town Hall, Provincetown, MA 02657

Members Present: John Dowd, Chairman; Paul Church; Meg Stewart; Polly Burnell; Carol Neal; and Eric Dray (Alternate)

Excused Absence: Tom Boland

Town Hall Representatives: Maxine Notaro, Permit Coordinator.

The Work Session commenced at 3:20 PM.

Work Session
Review and approve minutes

It was decided that copies of the minutes would be supplied to the Commission members to read and check over at their convenience and then would be voted upon at a subsequent meeting.

Administrative Reviews/Amendments/Discussions

Paul deRuyter, 211-215 Commercial Street – request for amendment to front façade

Mr. deRuyter returned and stated that he had meetings with the engineer. He said that the windows would be removed and restored and if any needed reconstruction, they would be done in kind. The Commission members made suggestions regarding the restoration and repair before removal. Paul Church, Polly Burnell and Carol Neal said they would be willing to consult with the construction people if necessary to offer help.

Gary Locke on behalf of George Flammer, Jr. – 172 Bradford Street, revised plans for relocation of cottage

Mr. Locke handed out copies of revised plans that incorporated suggestions made by Commission members at the last meeting. The old plans showed that the building was 2' taller. The Commission members questioned Mr. Lock regarding the new plans. There was a discussion regarding the 2-½ and 2 stories. The original plan increased one story to 2-½ stories. Eric Dray and others felt that going to a new height of building was inappropriate. Meg Stewart stated that the new, secondary structure should be in proportion to the primary structure.

It was moved to deny the plans without prejudice on the condition that new plans show a 1-½ story structure secondary to the main building.

Motion by: Paul Church

Seconded by: Meg Stewart

Yea: 5 Nay: 0

The Public Hearing portion of the meeting was called to order at 4:05 PM
Public Hearing

New Cases

Case #2004-062

Application by Sara Cole and Diarmuid O'Neal for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to construct an 18' x 14' addition with saltbox roof and dormers at the property located at 520 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.

John Souza and Diarmuid O'Neal presented Case #2004-062. The proposal is for a ¾ Cape with an 18' x 14' "el" addition. John Dowd stated that the new plans have changes from the previous, approved plans which were approved

by the old Historical Commission and that the Historical Commission did not approve the dormers on the front of the building. If the new plans were to be accepted, then the changes would have to be resubmitted.

Carol Neal read two letters from abutters who were against the plan and one letter (from 518 Commercial Street) in favor of the plan.

It was moved to accept the previous plans that were approved by the previous Historical Commission.

Motion by: John Dowd

Seconded by: Paul Church

Yea: 5 Nay: 0

Case #2004-063

Application by Fine Arts Work Center for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to add a new link between the Bins building and the Trap Shed building located at 24 Pearl Street and to remove and replace the existing cottage at the property located at 6 Fishburn Court, Provincetown, MA.

Polly Burnell had to step down from voting on this Case as she is on the Fine Arts Work Center Committee.

Michael Prodonau, Architect and Hunter O'Hanian, Executive Director of the Fine Arts Work Center represented this Case. Mr. Prodonau explained what the Fine Arts Work Center would like to accomplish by replace the existing cottage and shed building.

Eric Dray felt that the design was good and well-done regarding details. He suggested that the paired windows be centered under the dormer.

Carol Neal reported that 11 letters were received in support of the Fine Arts Work Center and that they would be available for the public to read.

During the portion of public comments Chris McCarthy, Executive Director of the Provincetown Art Museum stated that she was totally in support of the plan.

A motion was made to approve the demolition of the existing cottage and in the new building to place paired windows under the dormer. Eric Dray stated that this cottage is not historic and dated from the 1960s.

Motion by: Paul Church

Seconded by: Carol Neal

Yea: 5 Nay: 0

A motion was made to accept the addition of a new link between the Bins building and the Trap Shed building at 24 Pearl Street as presented.

Motion by: John Dowd

Seconded by: Eric Dray

Yea: 1 Nay: 0 Abstain: 1

(Meg Stewart abstained)

This Case is covered by Guideline #15.

Case #2204-064

Application by Ruth Gilbert and William Costa on behalf of David Silva and Paul Silva for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to demolish the existing structure and review the proposed building plans for the construction of a new three-bedroom single family dwelling at the property located at 19 West Vine Street, Provincetown, MA.

Nancy Correia, Attorney appeared with Ruth Gilbert and William Costa. She spoke about the demolishing of the existing building. The rebuild and redesign would be in the same footprint as the existing structure. Some of the doors and flooring are salvageable.

Mr. Costa described the submitted plans and said that the replacement windows would be in the same position and size.

He described the replacement windows and doors.

Members of the Commission read, for the record, 9 letters from abutters against the demolishing of the building and the rebuilding of a new one. One letter in favor, with reservations, was also read.

A member of the public, Edith Nechin, an abutter residing at 17 West Vine Street asked questions regarding the height of the new building and was concerned as to when work would commence if it were approved.

There were no other comments from members of the public.

Ruth Gilbert read the conclusion of a letter from the structural engineer. The letter stated that there was no way to save the building.

Eric Dray said that there are two levels to this case. One was to allow the demolition of the existing building and the second was the design after demolition being approved. Meg Stewart felt that if the building is demolished, it should be re-built as it. This was concurred by Carol Neal and Polly Burnell. Eric Dray would not support the replacement building with a higher roof (taller structure). A general discussion ensued regarding the roof pitch and height.

It was decided that a site visit would be made to 19 West Vine Street. At the site, Eric Dray asked if the “el” is historic. He would like to see shed dormers on the “el” instead of replacing the “el” with a new height. Some Commission members visited the inside of the house. When they returned there was an animated discussion regarding shed dormers in lieu of increasing the height.

It was moved to continue this discussion to the meeting of August 18th.

Motion by: Carol Neal

Seconded by: Eric Dray

Yea: 5 Nay: 0

William Costa will return to the meeting on August 18th with new drawings showing the suggested dormers requested by the Commission members.

Site Visit

A site visit to 14 Cottage Street for an on-site inspection of the existing dwelling was made following the above site visit. Neal Kimball and Mark Kinnane attended the site visit with some Commission members. It turned out that the original house was almost totally demolished which the Commission was not aware was going to be done. Meg Stewart asked about a request for demolition. John Dowd pointed out that all details should be exactly the way they were and that the new house would no longer be an old house but a reproduction.

Generally, Commission members felt that the house did not need to be demolished and that they were not advised as to a demolition. Meg Stewart wanted a stop work order issued. John Dowd stated this was not necessary, as no more demolition work will be done.

Mark Kinnane said that Warren Alexander, Building Commissioner, looked at the house and said that it was structurally unsound. John Dowd felt that as a compromise, retain what is left and a stop work order would not be necessary.

The Commission members felt that Mark Kinnane did not give them the proper information, initially.

Maxine Notaro said that she would talk to Warren Alexander.

The next meeting will be on Wednesday, August 18, 2004 at 3:30 PM. The voting for the approval of minutes for past meetings will be accomplished at this time.

A motion was made to adjourn the meeting at 7:00 PM.

Moved by: John Dowd

Seconded by: Meg Stewart

Yea: 4 Nay: 0

(Eric Dray and Polly Burnell were not present at the site visit.)

Respectfully submitted,
Joel Glasser

Recording Secretary

Approved by: _____
John Dowd (Chairman)

Date

Historic District Commission Meeting of 8/4/04