

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
PUBLIC MEETING
Town Hall
Provincetown, MA
WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 16, 2019

Members Present: Thomas Biggert (TB), Chairman, Pilgrim Monument Rep.; Laurie Delmolino (LD), Historical Commission Rep.; Hersh Schwartz (HS), Chamber of Commerce Rep.; John Dowd (JD), PGB Rep.; Martin Risteen (MR), Alternate.

Excused Absence: Michela Carew-Murphy (MCM), Alternate.

Unexcused Absence: Christopher Mathieson (CM), PAAM Rep.

Others Present: Annie Howard (AH), Building Commissioner.

Note: PTV taping was delayed at the start of the meeting.

Work Session: VOTES MAY BE TAKEN

1. Update on potential violations reported to the Building Commissioner.

None reported.

2. Determination as to whether the applications below involve any Exterior Architectural Features within the jurisdiction of the Commission; with Full Reviews to be placed on the Public Hearing agenda of November 6, 2019, and Administrative Reviews to be acted on by a subcommittee appointed by the Commission.

HS remarked that the following applications need drawings with larger print copy:
397A Commercial St.; 7 Commercial St.; 124 Commercial St.

TB made a motion to consider the following for Administrative Review:

i) 16 Cottage St.; ii) 200 Commercial St.; iii) 5 Winslow St.; iv) 6 Johnson St.; v) 65 Commercial St.; vi) 217 Bradford St.; vii) 83 Commercial St.

The motion was seconded and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR.

TB made a motion to consider the following for Full Review:

ix) 18 Commercial St.; x) 7 Commercial St.; xi) 124 Commercial St.; xii) 397A Commercial St.; xiii) 72B Commercial St.

LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR.

i) 16 Cottage St. (*continued from the meeting of October 2nd*) – To replace (4) windows and siding in kind.

No one presented. LD said she met with the owner and felt that, given the structure is a 50 year old garage with questionable contributing status which she interprets as not significant and of limited visibility, she could approve vinyl.

TB made a motion to approve as presented. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR

- ii) 200 Commercial St. – To replace windows in kind.
No one presented.
TB made a motion to approve with the condition that the panel and trim be wood. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR.
- iii) 5 Winslow St. – To replace an entrance door.
Mr. Yi presented.
HS said she appreciated the quality of the pictures included in the application. JD said the model of door presented was incorrect for the style of the architecture, which would be dated from 1840 to 1860. TB suggested a similar type door but without the windows at the top and small wood panels and MR stated a preference for a solid door.
Mr. Yi expressed a preference for the door replacement as presented and TB replied that he could agree based on the in-kind nature of the unit proposed. JD disagreed, made the case for correcting a previous replacement that was wrongly installed. LD acknowledged the right of the owner to replace in kind, but appealed to Mr. Yi to consider a more historically proper replacement. Mr. Yi said he would confer with his partner on the examples proposed by the HDC.
LD made a motion to approve as presented, or preferably to be replaced with a 2, 4, or 6 solid-paneled, all-wood door with all-wood trim. JD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; LD, JD, TB, HS, MR.
- iv) 6 Johnson St. – To replace an existing fence.
No one presented.
AH noted 6' high fencing. TB said it was unclear how far it sets back from the face of the house; LD said she thought it was 40' back from the street.
TB made a motion to continue the decision to the meeting of November 16, 2019. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, HS, LD, JD, MR.
- v) 65 Commercial St. – To replace roofing shingles.
No one presented. TB noted asphalt and architectural shingles.
TB made a motion to approve as presented. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, HS, LD, JD, MR.
- vi) 217 Bradford St. – To replace roofing and siding shingles.
No one presented. TB noted white cedar shingles replaced in kind. MR asked if clapboard would be replaced on the sides.
TB made a motion to approve as presented with the condition that any replacement trim be wood. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, HS, LD, JD, MR.
- vii) 83 Commercial Street – To replace (2) windows in kind.
No one presented. HS noted wood and TB white cedar shingles; Andersons, in kind; gable on the second floor; simulated light.
TB made a motion to approve as presented. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR.
- ix) 18 Commercial St. – To rebuild an existing deck, stairs, guard rails and to add stairs to the backyard.
No one presented. LD said she was fine with it, but wanted consistency.
TB made a motion to consider as Administrative Review. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-1-0; TB, HS, JD, MR, in favor; LD, opposed.
TB made a motion to approve as presented. JD seconded the motion and it passed, 4-1-0; TB, JD, HS, MR, in favor; LD, opposed.

3. Any other business that shall properly come before the Commission:

260 Commercial Street, Town Hall

Steve Wlodkowski, Deputy Director of Public Works, presented.

AH noted that the SW inside corner of the clapboard was in disrepair and in violation; would be replaced as existing.

TB made a motion to approve as presented. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR.

62 Mayflower

AH addressed the topic of a building that is out of the Historic District and in excess of 50 years old, but whereby 25% of the existing building is to be demolished; noted location is the vicinity of the "Marilyn Monroe" painted garage and that Mayflower is a private way and cannot be seen from Rt. 6; displayed diagrams, including roofline of the structure, which, she said, is significant and work to be done would be about 25% and that the special permit expires on the 30th of this month; owner is currently working off a zoning violation of the deck.

MR suggested some research be done on the structure prior to a vote, but JD mentioned the limited visibility and LD noted that other demolitions have been approved at over 25% of the building in the District, and added they would just hope George Washington never slept there.

TB made a motion to not delay demolition at 62 Mayflower. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR.

4. Public Comments: On any matter not on the agenda below.

None.

5. Public Hearing: VOTES MAY BE TAKEN

a) HDC 20-032

Application by **Derik Burgess, of Cape Associates, Inc.** on behalf of **Dennis Condon**, requesting to replace a door on the south elevation of the structure located at **571 Commercial Street**.

Derik Burgess and Robin Callahan presented. Mr. Burgess said the application is a continuation of a previous admin approval for trim, but which has become a Full Review concerning the replacement of a 6' door that is leaking with a single pane transom also in disrepair; displayed pictures of the location and said new model is to be wood.

No public comments.

TB made a motion to approve as presented. LD seconded the motion and it passed 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR.

b) HDC 20-039 (*continued from the meeting of October 2nd*)

Application by **Henry F. Pihl & James Rifino** requesting to elevate a structure, add, replace and relocate windows and doors, replace wood shingles, extend a dormer on the east elevation, add a second floor extension in the rear, and renovate a roof light at the property located at **8 Bradford Street**.

Henry Pihl & James Rifino presented. HS read from a signed Mullin Rule to sit on the case. JD sat out the case. Plans addressed were dated October 15, 2019.

Mr. Pihl said that per the front elevation recommendations, they brought the windows down from the gable and separated them, applied 6-over-6s in the shed dormer and determined existing trim would remain the same. Mr. Rifino said the roofline was also rectified per the trim, and that windows in the kitchen would mirror those at the top of the gable

No public comments or letters.

LD read through the original requests and checked off those items that had been amended as such, which left two lower right windows on the northwest rear elevation, which Mr. Pihl described as 9-lite casements designed with a wood element below to provide a countertop in the kitchen and keep the feel of the same size above.

LD asked if Hardie Board had been previously requested, which the applicants said it had, which prompted LD to condition wood instead.

TB made a motion to approve with the condition that the panels be removed from the lower right windows on the northwest elevation and all trim be wood, four or six panel wood doors. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 3-0-0; TB, LD, HS.

c) **HDC 20-041**

Application by **Angela McCarthy** requesting to replace clapboards with cedar shingles, change the types of a window and a door on the west elevation, move a window on the east elevation, change material on a rear deck, and replace a window with glass blocks on the north elevation of the structure at the property located at **199 Bradford Street**.

Angela McCarthy and Zyg Plater, next-door neighbor, presented. Ms. McCarthy said moving the window on the east elevation over 3 to 4 feet is the main reason she is before the Board, as well as posts on the front porch to be wrapped in Versa-Tec for a uniform look; said posts to be mahogany, as well as the decking and railing; composite for rear deck floor; asked after glass blocks in front and portal windows.

Mr. Plater remarked that they are happy with where the composite deck is proposed; thanked the HDC for its shingle change-out. No other public comments or letters.

TB suggested the Board was fine with all proposed excepting the windows. JD rejected the glass blocks as proposed and said the port hole in the gable on the north elevation is cute, but not correct, but was in agreement with the elimination of the upper windows on the gable north end and the movement of the east elevation windows a few feet to the right – which others concurred. JD pointed out that trim had always been painted in the past and should be now; said wrap posts can be made over-scaled, or get too fat.

Ms. McCarthy stated her desire for the port window in the bathroom as a means of getting more light into the space.

TB made a motion to approve as presented with the following conditions: no glass blocks; no west side gable or bathroom windows; eliminate basement window. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR.

d) **HDC 20-044**

Application by **Paul Colburn**, on behalf of **Julia Gilmore**, requesting to replace rotted underpinnings and framing under a deck on the south elevation and replace all windows on the structure located at **647 Commercial Street**.

Paul Colburn presented; said the replacements will be Andersons and reported that the street-side porch is sinking and the underpinnings need to be jacked-up and replaced. LD mentioned that the windows are the originals and suggested Marvin, Boston Sash and Pella as companies that perhaps still make wood window units. JD spoke on behalf of retaining the defining feature of the original wood windows.

No public comments or letters.

LD said she did a site visit and felt that the original windows looked as if they could be repaired or, if not, replaced with high-end wooden options. Mr. Colburn said he has spent years repairing the windows and that no one has been at the property since late September. LD recommended Briscoe windows, but AH said she wasn't sure what sizes were available.

TB made a motion to approve with the conditions that the skirt material and trim be wood and that the replacement windows be wood inside and out, single-pane. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR.

AH asked what might happen if someone assumes the property and wants to live there full-time, to which LD replied, they get storm windows. JD stated that Town has lost perhaps 80% of the original windows which give the properties their distinctive character and AH remarked that it is probably more than that.

e) **HDC 20-046**

Application by **Mark Kinnane**, of **Cape Associates, Inc.**, on behalf of **Barry Peskin**, requesting to not install a chimney on the structure located at **11 Brewster Street**.

No one presented.

TB made a motion to postpone the decision to the meeting of November 2, 2019. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR.

f) **HDC 20-052** *(continued from the meeting of October 2, 2019)*

Application by **Kevin Bazarian** requesting to expand a cottage 8' to the rear and add a second floor with a balcony on the property located at **118 Bradford Street**.

Kevin Bazarian, and partner Jose Perez, presented. Mr. Bazarian announced that they were the owners of the Clarendon Guest House and had received gallons through Economic Development to add a room to the property; described the aspects of the addition per their application, which will be on the second floor over the one room unit with kitchen in the rear; elevated to remove the structure from the flood zone, stone foundation, clapboard on the front and white cedar shingles all around, all wood trim; welcomed recommendations from HDC. JD pointed toward brackets on the balcony, as opposed to a cantilevered application.

No public comments or letters.

LD noted the one and a half stories are allowed by HDC policy and visibility on only one side. Mr. Bazarian said the east elevation has an abutter and so the proposal for less windows. MR remarked that a window would not be needed on the auxiliary building.

TB made a motion to approve as presented with the conditions that all trim be wood and shingles used throughout. JD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, JD, LD, HS, MR.

MR read from history on the property.

g) **HDC 20-056**

Application by **Ryan Campbell** and **James Derosier** requesting to replace 6 windows, 2 of which will be relocated, and a door on the north elevation, 2 windows on the east elevation and 2 skylights on the structure located at **19 Tremont Street, U2**.

Ryan Campbell, designer and co-owner and James Derosier, co-owner, presented. Mr. Campbell said the project is a complete gut-renovation of the interior of the two-family house, said they own the east two-thirds of the building, including the end-wall; described the current state of the building as a mish-mash and submitted a new drawing for consideration; 6 windows to be replaced, aligning top with lower windows; adding two windows on the end-wall to get more light and offer relief; octagonal window to be removed and front door replaced once financially able; trim to be built to match front of the house.

Delwyn Trent, owner and Trustee of Unit #4, 19 Tremont St., spoke, said the Association approves and encourages the changes as proposed. TB read a letter in support from Jim Watkins, a neighbor across the street.

JD said the two windows on the side will make a huge difference. AH asked per the property line set-back, in hoping it is to be greater than 3'. Mr. Campbell said it would be so. LD noted the two skylights are not visible and had no problem with the application, as did HS.

MR noted the rebuild of 1985 and that the structure is non-contributing; said he had no problem with the design. JD said he was fine with it, too, respected the wish for more light.

Mr. Campbell said no additional future changes are anticipated. JD suggested separating the heavy windows at the sides of the door on the ground floor and recommended the trim on the east elevation be brought straight down.

TB said he felt the 6-over-6s on the first floor left side should not be changed out for 9-over-9s. Mr. Campbell said they are actually 6-over-9s and would drop the sill for 9-over-9s.

TB made a motion to approve as presented. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR.

LD asked if the owner of a non-contributing building opts to go back to the original style, does it then become contributing, to which AH said would be decided by survey and the determination of the significant architectural feature.

h) **HDC 20-057**

Application by **Renewal by Anderson** requesting to replace 9 windows and remove 2 bow windows, replacing each of the latter with 3 new double-hung windows on the structure located at **24 Winthrop Street**.

Gigino Montesi, of Renewal by Anderson, presented; said owner is looking to restore the building to what was, pointed to two bow windows on the second floor that are rotting to be replaced with three double-hungs, custom-built; three in the front which will be replaced in kind with a picture window and two double-hung flankers; said grill pattern are 2-over-2s, top sash only; 6-over-nothing for the side units.

MR read of the history of the building as contributing.

TB made a motion to approve with the condition that the trim be replaced with wood. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR.

Mr. Montesi said the owner was seeking Azek trim, but that they could comply with the Board's determination.

AH presented a letter from Dr. Shiffman in regards to 18 Bradford Street; revised plans for 5 Conwell Street; and sought signatures for 429 Commercial Street.

21 Off Cemetery Road

MR said he took a look at the site and gathered information as well, but that nothing he found should promote delay of the demolition, or inspire preservation therein.

TB made a motion to remove the demolition delay at 21 Off Cemetery Road. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR.

6. Review and approval of Minutes:

TB made a motion to approve the meeting minutes of August 7, 2019. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR.

7. Deliberations on Pending Decisions: VOTES MAY BE TAKEN

1. TB made a motion to approve the September 18, 2019 decision of **HDC 20-002; 594 Commercial Street**, written and read into record by MR. JD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, JD, LD, HS, MR.
2. TB made a motion to approve the October 16, 2019 decision of **HDC 20-056; 19 Tremont Street**, written and read into the record by JD. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR.
3. TB made a motion to approve the October 16, 2019 decision of **HDC 20-052; 118 Bradford Street**, written by JD and read into the record by MR. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR.

4. TB made a motion to approve the October 16, 2019 decision of **HDC 20-057**; **24 Winthrop Street**, written and read into the record by LD. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR.
5. TB made a motion to approve the October 16, 2019 decision of **HDC 20-032**; **571 Commercial Street**, written and read into the record by HS. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR.

Today's decisions to be written as follows:

TB: **HDC 20-044**; **647 Commercial Street**; LD: **HDC 20-041**; **199 Bradford Street**;
HS: **HDC 20-039**; **8 Bradford Street**.

HS stated that **HDC 20-018**; **5 Conwell Street** and **HDC 20-051**; **225 Commercial Street** were filed with Town Clerk on October 3, 2019.

AH announced the new Provincetown Banner deadline as having moved to Wednesday from Thursday and discussion ensued on how this would affect the HDC filings for Full Review and document prep with attendant costs.

JD raised the issue of a case where the work performed does not align with what HDC approved, and the Board discussed potential elevation of properties at 7 Commercial Street and those in the adjoining area to be determined at a future hearing.

TB announced an education sub-committee to be determined at a forthcoming meeting. AH said that any invitee from the Board should go through AH, per staff procedure.

TB made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 6:25pm. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0; TB, LD, HS, JD, MR.

Respectfully Submitted,
Jody O'Neil