

TOWN OF PROVINCETOWN
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF
June 4, 2014 3:30pm

MEETING HELD IN THE JUDGE WELSH HEARING ROOM

Members Present: Ms. Polly Burnell, Mr. David McGlothlin, Mr. John Dowd, Mr. Lance Hatch, and Mr. Thomas Biggert.

Members Absent: Ms. Marcene Marcoux

Staff Present: Mr. Leif D. Hamnquist, Permit Coordinator

Meeting called to order by Mr. John Dowd at 3:45pm

1. Public Statements

Mr. John Dowd read a letter in to the record objecting to a granite fence at the property 63 Commercial. The commission agreed that a proposal for the granite fence never came before the commission.

2. Administrative Reviews

- a) 594 Commercial Street – amend a previously approved decision – **The board discussed whether or not the changes being proposed were significant enough to need a full review. John Dowd made it clear that in the future changes this significant to a previously approved application should go back for full review for the benefit of the community.** -Approved
- b) 650 Commercial Street – replace 3 windows in kind - Approved
- c) 303 Bradford Street – replace 8 windows in kind - Approved
- d) 31 Court Street – decide if door is viewable from public right of way - Approved
- e) 21 Bangs Street -- appeal to change condition on a door of a previously approved administrative review – Peter page pleaded his case before the board and presented examples of the door that he proposed at the May 21st meeting. Mr. John Dowd understands that the structure at 21 Bang St is a mismatched building and that the proposed door could be suitable. – Approved to strike the condition on the May 21st administrative review.
- f) Any administrative reviews received that could not be reasonably anticipated

3. Review and approve Minutes of the May 7, 2014 and the May 21, 2014 meetings

Motion made by Polly Burnell to approve the minutes from the May 7th as written and May 21st meeting as amended and was seconded by Thomas Biggert. The motion passed unanimously.

4. Public Hearings

The public hearing portion of the meeting was opened by Mr. John Dowd at 4:16 pm

5. Public Hearings

- a) **Case #FY14-69 (continued from May 21)**
Application by David McMahon to construct a two floor addition on the north side of the main structure at the property located at **7 Whorf's Court**.

Mr. McMahon appeared before the commission and briefly explained the project once again.

The commission reviewed the new drawings.

Mr. Lance Hatch asked about the how the properties worked along Whorfs Court so he could understand the spacing between the existing structures.

Two letters in support were read into the record.

Mr. John Dowd asked for further explanation about the how a certain wall plane worked along the north elevation, and the applicant explained

Ms. Polly Burnell expressed concerns that the once small structures in town are being destroyed with additions and asked if the commission agreed. She also felt that what was left of the historic structure had been eroded away.

Mr. Thomas Biggert agreed with Ms. Burnell that additions upon addition to existing buildings are destroying the character of the neighborhood.

The applicant argued that there are other examples in town of structures dwarfing others and that he was being considerate in regards to materials used and the overall mass and scale of the proposed addition.

Mr. Dowd asserted that the structure cannot be seen from Commercial Street and that the hill behind it helps keep the house in a relative scale and that the proposal doesn't impact the community as a whole.

The commission discussed how and if the proposal fits into the overall fabric of the neighborhood and town.

Mr. Hatch understands the desire to enlarge the structure and that since Whorfs Court is a dead end he feels there may be over crowding at the end of that right of way and he would be inclined to approve the design, with reservations.

Mr. David McGlothlin has visited Whorfs Court numerous times and believes the proposal helps to balance out the streetscape and he is ok with the work that has already been done but has issues with endless additions to structures and doesn't want buildings in Provincetown to explode into 'McMansions'.

Motion made by Polly Burnell to approve the proposal as presented and was seconded by Thomas Biggert. 3 approved 2 denied(Polly Burnell and Thomas Biggert), the motion passed.

b) **Case #FY14-67**

Application by David Milliken on behalf of William McLaughlin to extend a rear dormer and add windows, construct a recessed dormer with doors, and construct a roof deck with spiral stairs for access at the property located at **8-10 Atlantic Avenue**.

David Milliken appeared before the commission to present the proposal.

Mr. Biggert made notice that the proposal is very visible from Bradford Street and asked the applicant if the deck can be lowered to line up with the roofs eave.

Mr. McGlothlin said that the roof deck is a 'no go' for him.

Mr. Hatch agreed that the recessed deck is ok but the roof deck in a 'no go' for him as well

Motion made by John Dowd to approve the windows and the recessed deck but denied the roof deck and spiral stair and was seconded by Thomas Biggert. The motion passed unanimously.

c) **Case #FY14-72**

Application by Richard Baker on behalf of William Elovitz to replace an existing bay window and door on the rear of the building with a four panel sliding glass unit at the property located at **405 Commercial Street**.

Richard Baker appeared before the commission to present the proposal.

The commission asked if the design will be all glass and Mr. Baker explained it would be and that it would be akin to the neighbors and the first floor condo.

Mr. Biggert understands the want to have full panorama view but wishes there was a more creative way to achieve a great view without going all 'Hollywood'.

Motion made by Polly Burnell to approve as presented and was seconded by Thomas Biggert. The motion passed unanimously.

d) **Case #FY14-73**

Application by Mark Kinnane on behalf of Daniel Wolf to add an addition to west and north sides of building, construct a breezeway between the principle structure and an existing shed, replace and add various windows and doors, add dormers to the roof on the west side, and construct a widows walk atop the structure at the property located at **3 Prince Street**.

Mark Kinnane of Cape Associates Inc., Dan Wolf and Heide Schutes appeared before the board to present the proposal.

Mr. Kinnane distributed some drawings to help the commission understand the project further.

Mr. Wolf explained the history of the building and that he and Heidi would like to make the building their full time residence.

Mr. Kinnane explained that the breezeway was needed to meet building code requirements for separation between structure and how elements of the building work and why.

Mr. Dowd had a hard time understanding the building because it's very telescopic and hard to understand through elevations because of the additive nature of previous additions and felt the proposed alterations were 'tortured'.

Ms. Burnell can't give her support for the project in its current design.

Mr. Biggert thinks the added porch was a little to 'suburban'.

Mr. McGlothlin expressed concerns about certain aspects of the design and wanted to preserve the aspects that he liked.

Mr. Dowd gave options to Mr. Kinnane about what would be more appropriate for the sun/dining room.

Discussion about how the proposal will make the building look like a three storied building ensued.

Mr. Wolf explained that the northern façade needed alterations to make it more appropriate with the historic nature of the town.

The commission went to length to help redesign the project to make it more historically appropriate.

The commission unanimously disapproved of the roof deck and struck it from the design.

Motion made by John Dowd that the existing conditions of the building be retained on the east, west and south elevations with the addition of a shed roof over the sun porch/dining room with banked windows on the south, and east and banked windows and a door on the west elevation of the sunporch, and the proposed changes for the north elevation be accepted except change the solid enclosed staircase to an open staircase with captured balusters and the commission will sign

the redesigned drawings at the next meeting and was seconded by Polly Burnell. The motion passed unanimously.

e) **Case #FY14-74**

Application by Cape Tip Construction requesting approval to amend a previously approved decision for an addition at the property located at **5 School Street**.

Kaye McFadden from Cape Tip Construction appeared before the board to explain the amendment to the original proposal.

The commission needed photos and the original file to better understand the project.

The commission agreed that the shed roof proposed by the building department wasn't as pleasing as the flat roof proposed.

Two letters opposing the proposal were read into the record.

Ms. Burnell agreed the amendment wasn't consistent with the historical nature of the town.

Ms. McFadden asked the commission what garage doors and access door would be appropriate for the garage, and the commission decided they will see it administratively at the next meeting

Motion made by John Dowd to approve as presented and was seconded by Thomas Biggert. 4 in favor and 1 abstained(Polly Burnell). The motion passed.

f) **Case #FY14-75**

Application by Kristine Hopkins requesting approval to place 11 solar panels upon the roof and place electrical equipment on the north side of the house located at **18 Alden Street**.

Kristine Hopkins and Donald Beal appeared before the commission to present the proposal.

8 letters in support, with one support letter having concerns about the noise emitted by the converter, were read into the record

Mr. Biggert understands that the town needs to start accepting the fact that solar panels will need to be accepted within the historic district.

Ms. Burnell noted the need for solar panels in town and noted that other municipalities are starting to find ways to integrate solar into their historic districts.

Mrs. Hopkins explained the converter doesn't create sound and that the panels are leased.

Motion made by John Down to approve as presented and was seconded by Polly Burnell. The motion passed unanimously.

At 6:45, a motion to adjourn was made by Ms. Burnell and seconded by John Dowd. Motion passed unanimously.

Respectfully submitted,

Gloria McPherson
Town Planner